Gregory M. Sheffer, State Bar No. 173124 Clifford A. Chanler, State Bar No. 135534 SHEFFER & CHANLER LLP 4400 Keller Avenue, Suite 200 2 Oakland, CA 94605 Tel: (510) 577-0747 Fax: (510) 577-0787 3 Attorneys for Plaintiff MICHAEL DIPIRRO 5 John R. Zebrowski, State Bar No. 118443 6 Rita M. Haeusler, State Bar No. 110574 HUGHES HUBBARD & REED LLP 7 350 S. Grand Avenue, Suite 3600 Los Angeles, California 90071 8 Tel: (213) 613-2800 Fax: (213) 613-2950 9 Attorneys for Defendants 10 ADVANTAGE PUBLISHERS GROUP, ADVANCED MARKETING SERVICES, 11 and SILVER DOLPHIN BOOKS 12 SUPERIOR COURT OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA 13 IN AND FOR THE COUNTY OF ALAMEDA, HAYWARD BRANCH 14 UNLIMITED CIVIL JURISDICTION 15 16 MICHAEL DIPIRRO, . No. 01-032045 17 Plaintiff, CONSENT JUDGMENT 18 19 ADVANTAGE PUBLISHERS GROUP; ADVANCED MARKETING SERVICES, 20 INC.; SILVER DOLPHIN BOOKS; and ) DOES 1 through 1000, 21 Defendants. 22 23 This Consent Judgment ("Agreement" or "Consent 24 Judgment") is entered into by and between Michael DiPirro and 25 ADVANTAGE PUBLISHERS GROUP, ADVANCED MARKETING SERVICES, and 26

SILVER DOLPHIN BOOKS (collectively hereafter "ADVANTAGE"), as of

CONSERT. JUDGHENT LA 526192 2

27

28

 . و

 July 24, 2002 (the "Effective Date"). The parties agree to the following terms and conditions:

## WHEREAS:

- A. Michael DiPirro is an individual residing in San Francisco, California, who seeks to promote awareness of exposures to toxic chemicals and improve human health by reducing or eliminating hazardous substances contained in consumer and industrial products;
- B. ADVANTAGE is a company that distributes and sells certain educational products and DiPirro alleged that in the course of some of the printings of two (2) of those products the manufacturer applied certain quantities of lead-containing paint or ink to the products, and that lead compounds are substances known to the State of California to cause birth defects (or other reproductive harm);
- C. The two (2) ADVANTAGE products which allegedly contained certain quantities of lead-containing paint (the lead or lead compound is hereinafter referred to as the "Listed Chemical"), and which are covered by this Agreement, are identified in Exhibit A (all such ADVANTAGE products are collectively referred to hereinafter as the "Products");
- D. On September 21, 2001, Michael DiPirro served ADVANTAGE and other public enforcement agencies with a document entitled "60-Day Notice of Violation" that provided ADVANTAGE. and such public enforcers, with notice that ADVANTAGE was allegedly in violation of Health & Safety Code \$25249.6 for

·\*•28

failing to warn purchasers that the Products sold in California purportedly exposed users to the Listed Chemical; and

- E. On November 26, 2001, Michael DiPirro filed a complaint entitled Michael DiPirro v. Advantage Publishers

  Group; Advanced Marketing Services, Inc.; Silver Dolphin Books
  et al. in the Alameda County Superior Court, naming ADVANTAGE as a defendant and alleging violations of Business & Professions

  Code \$17200 as well as Health & Safety Code \$25249.6 on behalf of individuals in California who have been exposed to one or more chemicals, listed pursuant to Proposition 65, contained in the Products sold by ADVANTAGE.
- F. ADVANTAGE contends that any exposure to lead in any lead-containing paints on any of the Products would not pose a "significant risk" of causing cancer or reproductive toxicity to users of the Products within the meaning of Health & Safety Code § 25249.10(c) because the quantity of such paints on the Products and any purported lead contained in those paints (where detected) was insignificant.
- G. ADVANTAGE contends that to the extent some of the units of the Products may have been found to have lead-containing paint applied to them, such units would have been manufactured by the manufacturer using paints that violated ADVANTAGE's specifications for the Products.
- H. ADVANTAGE contends that at no time prior to late May, 2001, did it have knowledge or information that lead-containing paint was or may have been applied by the manufacturer to some units of the Products.

2 3 4

I. Nothing in this Agreement shall be construed as an admission by ADVANTAGE of any fact, finding, issue of law or violation of law, nor shall compliance with this Agreement constitute or be construed as an admission by ADVANTAGE of any fact, finding, conclusion, issue of law or violation of law. However, this paragraph shall not diminish or otherwise affect the obligations, responsibilities, and duties of ADVANTAGE under this Agreement.

NOW THEREFORE, MICHAEL DIPIRRO AND ADVANTAGE AGREE AS FOLLOWS:

1.0 Product Warnings. In no event shall ADVANTAGE offer any of the Products for sale in California after July 24.
2002 which have not been reformulated to eliminate the presence of lead-containing paints or which does not bear the following warning statement:

"WARNING: This product contains lead, a chemical known to the State of California to cause birth defects (or other reproductive harm). Please wash hands after use.

The warning stated above may be placed on: (a) a product label; (b) on the accompanying packaging as a sticker; or (c) on a store sign sufficiently near the Products' point of sale so that it is likely to be read by an ordinary individual under customary conditions of purchase for the Products. For purposes of this Consent Judgment, a warning sticker placed on product packaging that is not available to the consumer before purchase, or on product packaging that does not accompany the Products when purchased, is not reasonably calculated to transmit the

requisite warning and, thus, may not be used to comply with this paragraph.

Notwithstanding any other provision of this Agreement, no warning for exposure to lead shall or need be provided by ADVANTAGE for any paint or ink applied to the Products that yields a human exposure of less than 0.5 micrograms (ugs) of lead per day.

1.1 Lead-Free Component Commitment. As part of its commitment to promote public health, ADVANTAGE agrees, over the next 12 months from the Effective Date, to use its best efforts to specify, or cause the specification of, lead-free paint whenever such materials are used on the Products sold by ADVANTAGE in the State of California.

1.2 Interim Health Safety Efforts. ADVANTAGE sold the Products in California from February, 1999 until late May, 2001. ADVANTAGE provided DiPirro with ample evidence that ADVANTAGE voluntarily recalled the Products beginning on or about June 1. 2001, under the Consumer Product Safety Commission's ("CPSC") Fast Track Product Recall Program. ADVANTAGE, with the assistance and cooperation of the CPSC, voluntarily recalled the Products due to the possibility that some of the units being distributed or sold might contain a small quantity of lead-containing paint and therefore might be in violation of CPSC's federal regulations under the Ban of Lead-Containing Paint and Certain Common Products Bearing Lead-Containing Paint, 16 C.F.R. Part 1303.

1

4

7

6

8

10 11

12 13

14

15

16

17 18

19

20

21

22

24

23

25

26 27

28

Between June 1, 2001 and July 12, 2001, ADVANTAGE, working with CPSC, voluntarily undertook the following actions to ensure the safety of the consumers of the Products:

- (1) Recalled approximately 160,000 units of the Products which had been distributed or sold (worldwide) between February, 1995 and May, 2001;
- 2) Notified all consumers, retailers and wholesalers (via letter) about the recall;
- (3) Notified the public of the recall via a joint news release with the CPSC;
- (4) Established a toll-free number for consumers to inquire about the recall:
- (5) Provided a lead-free replacement stencil sheet and lead-free replacement pen for consumers and retailers, along with a letter of explanation;
- (6) Provided information about the recall on ADVANTAGE's automated system and website; and
- (7) Provided retailers with a poster about the recall to display in each of their stores.

As such, the parties believe that no interim warning program is warranted in this matter.

2. Payment Pursuant To Health & Safety Code
\$25249.7(b). Pursuant to Health & Safety Code \$25249.7(b),
ADVANTAGE shall pay a civil penalty of \$500.00 (five hundred dollars), to be made within five (5) days of the Effective DatThe penalty payment is to be made payable to "Sheffer & Chan-+

LLP In Trust For Michael DiPirro". If the Consent Judgment is not approved by the Court, DiPirro will return all funds, with interest thereon at the prevailing federal funds rate (currently set at 1.75% per annum), within five (5) calendar days of notice of the Court's decision. All penalty monies shall be apportioned by DiPirro in accordance with Health & Safety Code \$25192, with 75% of these funds remitted to the State of California's Department of Toxic Substances Control.

3.0 Reimbursement Of Fees And Costs. The parties acknowledge that DiPirro and his counsel offered to resolve this dispute without reaching terms on the amount of fees and costs to be reimbursed to them, thereby leaving this fee issue to be resolved after the material terms of the agreement had been settled. ADVANTAGE then expressed a desire to resolve the fee and cost issue shortly after the other settlement terms had been finalized. The parties then attempted to (and did) reach an accord on the compensation due to DiPirro and his counsel under the private attorney general doctrine codified at C.C.F. \$1021.5 for all work performed through the Effective Date of the Agreement.

Under the private attorney general doctrine codified at C.C.P. \$1021.5, ADVANTAGE shall reimburse DiPirro and his counsel for his fees and costs, incurred as a result of investigating, bringing this matter to ADVANTAGE's attention. litigating and negotiating a settlement in the public interest. ADVANTAGE shall pay DiPirro and his counsel \$4,500.00 (four thousand five hundred dollars) except as provided for in paragraph 3.1 to 3.6 below, for all attorneys' fees, expert and the settlement in the public interest.

 investigation fees, and litigation costs, within five (5) days of the Effective Date. Payment should be made payable to "Sheffer & Thanler LLP". If the Consent Judgment is not approved by the Court, DiPirro and Sheffer & Chanler LLP will return all funds, with interest thereon at the prevailing federal funds rate (currently set at 1.75% per annum), within five (5) calendar days of notice of the Court's decision.

- Approval. The parties acknowledge that, pursuant to recent interpretations of Health & Safety Code \$25249.7, a noticed motion is required to obtain judicial approval of this Agreement. Accordingly, the parties agree to use their best efforts to file a Joint Motion to Approve the Agreement within a reasonable period of time after execution of this Agreement. As part of its best efforts commitment, ADVANTAGE agrees to transmit a draft of the moving papers for the approval within fourteen (14) calendar days of the Effective Date of this Agreement. Pursuant to C.C.P. \$1021.5, ADVANTAGE agrees to reimburse DiPirro and his counsel for their reasonable fees and costs incurred in seeking judicial approval of this Agreement. to the extent described in paragraphs 3.2 through 3.6.
- 3.2 If no opposition to the motion to approve (nor objection to the terms of the agreement) is filed or otherwise transmitted by any third party, ADVANTAGE agrees to reimburse DiFirro under Section 3.1 for any additional reasonable fees and/or costs in an amount not to exceed \$1,500.
- 3.3. In the event that any third party, including any public enforcer, objects or otherwise comments to one or more

provisions of this Agreement, ADVANTAGE agrees to use its best efforts to support each of the terms of the Agreement, as well as to seek judicial approval of this Agreement. ADVANTAGE agrees to send DiPirro a draft of the moving papers referenced in paragraph 3.1 within fourteen (14) days of the Effective Date of this Agreement. If a joint motion cannot reasonably be filed within twenty-one (21) days of the Effective Date, DiPirro may file the motion to approve on his own.

- 3.4. In the event that such an objection or opposition is transmitted or filed by any third party, ADVANTAGE agrees to reimburse DiPirro under Section 3.1 and to reimburse DiPirro for his additional reasonable attorneys' fees and costs incurred in securing approval of this Consent Judgment in an amount not to exceed \$200.
- 3.5. In the event that defending this Agreement from such objection or opposition from any third party requires a declaration from an expert, then ADVANTAGE agrees to reimburse DiPirro, in addition to any attorney's fees and costs under section 3.4, for such expert's reasonable fees and costs in an amount not to exceed \$200.
- 3.6. ADVANTAGE's payment of DiPirro's legal fees and costs pursuant to sections 3.1-3.5 shall be due within ten (10) calendar days after receipt of a billing statement from DiPirro ("Additional Fee Claim"). Payment of the Additional Fee Claim shall be made payable to the "Sheffer & Chanler LLP." ADVANTAGE has the right to object to DiPirro's reimbursement request and may submit the resolution of this issue to the American Arbitration Association (AAA) in Northern California to

3 4 5

1

7 8 9

6

10 11

13

12

15 16

14

17

18 19

20 21

22

23 24

25

26 27

28

determine the reasonableness of the additional fees and costs sought. Any arbitration claim on this issue of reimbursement for the Additional Fee Claim must be filed with AAA and served on DiPirro within ten (10) calendar days following DiPirro's service of the Additional Fee Claim on ADVANTAGE. If an arbitration notice is not filed with AAA in a timely manner, ADVANTAGE's right to arbitrate this matter is waived. DiPirro may then file a motion, pursuant to C.C.P. \$1021.5, with the Court seeking his (and his attorneys') fees and costs incurred as set forth in this paragraph.

Michael DiPirro's Release Of ADVANTAGE. Michael DiPirro, by this Agreement, on behalf of himself, his agents, representatives, attorneys, assigns, and in the interest of the general public, waives all rights to institute or participate in, directly or indirectly, any form of legal action, and releases all claims, liabilities, obligations, losses, costs. expenses, fines, penalties, fees, and damages, restitution, injunction, and any other form of relief, whether legal or equitable, against ADVANTAGE and its directors, officers, employees, agents, parents, subsidiaries, successors and assigns, whether under Proposition 65 or the Business & Profession Code \$17200, et seq. based on their alleged failure to warn about exposure to the Listed Chemical contained in any of the Products. This Agreement is a full, final, and binding resolution between DiPirro, on behalf of himself and in the interest of the general public, and ADVANTAGE, of any violation of Proposition 65. Business & Professions Code section 17200, 25 seq., or any other claim that could have been asserted by the

11

10

13 14

12

15 16

17

18

19 20

21

22

24

25 26

<u>.</u>27

28

general public based on alleged failure to warn for exposure to lead and/or lead compounds in the Products or other facts alleged in the Complaint. The parties intend that compliance with this Agreement to resolve any issue now, in the past, or in the future concerning the Products' past and present, and future (up to the date of compliance established in Paragraph 1, above. and in the future so long as ADVANTAGE complies with this Agreement) compliance with Proposition 65 as such compliance pertains to the Products at issue. In addition, DiPirro, on behalf of himself, his attorneys, and his agents, waives all rights to institute any form of legal action against ADVANTAGE and its attorneys or representatives, for all actions or statements made by ADVANTAGE or its attorneys or representatives, in the course of responding to alleged violations of Proposition 65 or Business & Profession Code \$17200 by ADVANTAGE. Provided, however, that DiPirro shall remain free to institute any form of legal action to enforce the provisions of this Consent Judgment.

ADVANTAGE's Release Of Michael DiPirro.

ADVANTAGE, by this Agreement, waives all rights to institute any form of legal action against Michael DiPirro and his attorneys or representatives, for all actions or statements made by Michael DiPirro or his attorneys or representatives, in the course of seeking enforcement of Proposition 65 or Business & Profession Code \$17200 against ADVANTAGE in this litigation.

Provided, however, that ADVANTAGE shall remain free to institute any form of legal action to enforce the provisions of this Consent Judgment.

1

5

7 8

9

11 12

13

14 15

16

17

18

19

20 21

22

2324

25

26

27

28

6. Court Approval. If, for any reason, this Consent Judgment is not ultimately approved by the Court, this Agreement shall be deemed null and void.

ADVANTAGE Sales Data. ADVANTAGE understands that the sales data provided to counsel for DiPirro by ADVANTAGE was a material factor upon which DiPirro has relied to determine the amount of payments made pursuant to Health & Safety Code \$25249.7(b) in this Agreement. To the best of ADVANTAGE's knowledge, the sales data provided is true and accurate. In the event that DiPirro discovers facts that demonstrate to a reasonable degree of certainty that the sales data is materially inaccurate, the parties shall meet in a good faith attempt to resolve the matter within ten (10) days of ADVANTAGE's receipt of notice from DiPirro of his intent to challenge the accuracy of the sales data. If this good faith attempt fails to resolve DiPirro's concerns, DiPirro shall have the right to re-institute an enforcement action against ADVANTAGE, for those additional Products, based upon any existing 60-Day Notices of violation served on ADVANTAGE. In such case, all applicable statutes of limitation shall be deemed tolled for the period between the date DiPirro filed the instant action and the date DiPirro notifies ADVANTAGE that he is re-instituting the action for the additional Products. Provided, however, that ADVANTAGE shall have no additional liability, and DiPirro waives any claims that might otherwise be asserted, from the Effective Date until the date that DiPirro provides notice under this Paragraph 7, so long as ADVANTAGE has complied with the requirements of Section

9 10

11 12

13

14

15 16

17

18

19

20

21

22

24

23

25

26 27

28

2 for all of the Products, including those numbers of Products additionally discovered.

- 8. Severability. In the event that any of the provisions of this Agreement are held by a court to be unenforceable, the validity of the enforceable provisions shall not be adversely affected.
- 9. Attorney's Fees. In the event that a dispute arises with respect to any provision(s) of this Agreement (including, but not limited to, disputes arising from payments to be made under this Agreement), reasonable attorneys' fees incurred from the resolution of such dispute shall be available to the prevailing party. This provision, however, shall not apply to the procedure set forth in paragraphs 3.1 to 3.6 which are to be governed by the principles of CCP § 1021.5.
- 10. Governing Law. The terms of this Agreement shall be governed by the laws of the State of California.
- 11. Notices. All correspondence to Michael DiPirro shall be mailed to:

Gregory M. Sheffer, Esq. Sheffer & Chanler LLP 4400 Keller Ave., Suite 200 Oakland, CA 94605 Tel:(510) 577-0747

All correspondence to ADVANTAGE shall be mailed to:

John R. Zebrowski, Esq. Hughes, Hubbard & Reed LLP Two California Plaza 350 South Grand Avenue Los Angeles, CA 90071 Tel: (213) 613-2800

12. Compliance With Reporting Requirements (Health & Safety Code \$25249.7(f)). The parties acknowledge that the

-13-

reporting provisions of Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(f) apply to this Consent Judgment. Counsel for DiPirro shall comply with that section by submitting the required reporting form to, and serving a copy of this Consent Judgment on, the California Attorney General's Office when noticing the Motion to Approve hearing, if one is required by law. Counsel for DiPirro shall submit the Consent Judgment to the Court in accordance with the requirements of Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(f) and its implementing regulations, thereby allowing the Attorney General to serve any comments to this Consent Judgment prior to the end of the review period.

- 13. Counterparts and Facsimile. This Agreement may be executed in counterparts and facsimile, each of which shall be deemed an original, and all of which, when taken together, shall constitute one and the same document.
- 14. Authorization. The undersigned are authorized to execute this Agreement on behalf of their respective parties and have read, understood and agree to all of the terms and conditions of this Agreement.

AGREED TO: DATE:	DATE: 24 July 02
Michael DiPirro PLAINTIFF	Advantage Publishers Group DEFENDANT
AGREED TO: DATE:	AGREED TO: DATE: 24 July 02
California Department of Justice/Office of the Attorney General	Advanced Marketing Services, Inc. DEFENDANT

reporting provisions of Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(f) apply to this Consent Judgment. Counsel for DiPirro shall comply with that section by submitting the required reporting form to, and serving a copy of this Consent Judgment on, the California Attorney General's Office when noticing the Motion to Approve hearing, if one is required by law. Counsel for DiPirro shall submit the Consent Judgment to the Court in accordance with the requirements of Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(f) and its implementing regulations, thereby allowing the Attorney General to serve any comments to this Consent Judgment prior to the end of the review period.

į

- 13. Countemparts and Facsimile. This Agreement may be executed in countemparts and facsimile, each of which shall be deemed an original, and all of which, when taken together. shall constitute one and the same document.
- 14. Authorisation. The undersigned are authorized to execute this Agreement on behalf of their respective parties and have read, understood and agree to all of the terms and conditions of this Agreement.

Mil Suff	DATE: 24 July 02  Andrew & Atanley-VP
Michael DiPirre PLAINTIFF	Advantage Publishers Group DEFENDANT
AGREED TO: DATE:	AGREED TO: 24 9-1-02
California Department of Justice/Office of the Attorney General	Advanced Marketing Services, Inc. DEFENDANT

DEFENDANT [Not a Person or Entity]

APPROVED AS TO FORM:

DATE:

Gregory Sheffer

Attorney for Plaintiff MICHAEL DIPIRRO

APPROVED AS, TO, FORM:

DATE:

John R. Zabrowski Attorney for Defendants ADVANTAGE PUBLISHERS GROUP ADVANCED MARKETING SERVICES.

INC., SILVER DOLPHIN BOOKS



CONSIDIT JUDGHENT LA 526192\_2