# SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT

## 1. <u>INTRODUCTION</u>

# 1.1 Anthony Held And Cost Plus, Inc.

This Settlement Agreement is entered into by and between Anthony E. Held, Ph.D., P.E (hereinafter "Held") and Cost Plus, Inc., (hereinafter "Cost Plus"), with Held and Cost Plus collectively referred to as the "Parties." Held is an individual residing in California who seeks to promote awareness of exposures to toxic chemicals and improve human health by reducing or eliminating hazardous substances contained in consumer products. Cost Plus employs ten or more persons and is a person in the course of doing business for purposes of Proposition 65.

#### 1.2 General Allegations

Held alleges that Cost Plus has manufactured, distributed and/or sold in the State of California children's toys containing di(2ethylhexyl)phthalate including, but not limited to, Mini Clown Fish Squirt, SKU #369303, Mini Turtle Squirt, SKU #369301, the Mini Shark Squirt, SKU 369304, and the Fabric Doctor Kit (Bag), SKU 3985995. Di(2ethylhexyl)phthalate is listed pursuant to the Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986, California Health & Safety Code §§25249.5 et seq. ("Proposition 65"), as a chemical known to the State of California to cause birth defects and other reproductive harm. Di(2ethylhexyl)phthalate shall be referred to herein as the "Listed Chemical."

#### 1.3 **Product Description**

The products that are covered by this Settlement Agreement are as follows: Mini Clown Fish Squirt, SKU #369303, Mini Turtle Squirt, SKU #369301, the Mini Shark Squirt, SKU

369304, and the Fabric Doctor Kit (Bag), SKU 3985995. All such items shall be referred to herein as the "Products."

#### 1.4 Notices of Violation

On or about May 23, 2008, Held served Cost Plus and various public enforcement agencies with a document entitled "60-Day Notice of Violation" (the "Notice") that provided Cost Plus and such public enforcers with notice that alleged that Cost Plus was in violation of California Health & Safety Code §25249.6 for failing to warn consumers and customers that the Products exposed users in California to the Listed Chemical. No public enforcer has diligently prosecuted the allegations set forth in the Notice.

On or about August 14, 2008, Held served Cost Plus and various public enforcement agencies with a document entitled "Supplemental Notice of Violation" ("Supplemental Notice") expressly alleging that Cost Plus is in violation of Health & Safety Code § 25249.6 with respect to exposures to the Listed Chemical arising from the Fabric Doctor Kit (Bag), SKU 3985995.

#### 1.5 No Admission

Cost Plus denies the material factual and legal allegations contained in Held's Notices and maintains that all products that it has sold and distributed in California, including the Products, have been and are in compliance with all laws. Nothing in this Settlement Agreement shall be construed as an admission by Cost Plus of any fact, finding, issue of law, or violation of law, nor shall compliance with this Settlement Agreement constitute or be construed as an admission by

Cost Plus of any fact, finding, conclusion, issue of law or violation of law, such being specifically denied by Cost Plus. However, this section shall not diminish or otherwise affect the obligations, responsibilities and duties of Cost Plus under this Settlement Agreement.

## 1.6 **Effective Date**

For purposes of this Settlement Agreement, the term "Effective Date" shall mean August 29, 2008.

# 2. INJUNCTIVE RELIEF: WARNINGS AND REFORMULATION

#### 2.1 **Reformulation Commitment**

As of the Effective Date, Cost Plus shall only sell or cause to be sold Products for sale in California that are Phthalate Free, as set forth below. For purposes of this Settlement Agreement, "Phthalate Free" Products shall mean Products containing less than or equal to 1,000 parts per million ("ppm") of the Listed Chemical, when analyzed pursuant to Environmental Protection Agency ("EPA") testing methodologies 3580A and 8270C.

### 2.2 **Product Warnings**

After the Effective Date, Cost Plus shall not sell, ship, or offer to be shipped for sale in California, Products containing the Listed Chemical unless such Products are sold with the clear and reasonable warnings set out in Section 2.3 and 2.4 or comply with the reformulation requirements of Phthalate Free Products set out in Section 2.1.

Any warning issued for Products pursuant to Section 2.3 and 2.4, below, shall be prominently placed with such conspicuousness as compared with other words, statements, designs or devices as to render it likely to be read and understood by an ordinary individual under customary conditions before purchase or, for Products shipped directly to an individual in California, before use.

# 2.3 Warnings For Retail Store Sales

(a) **Product Labeling.** Cost Plus may perform its warning obligation by affixing a warning to the packaging of, labeling to, or, if no label exists, directly on each Product

(b) sold in retail outlets in California by Cost Plus or its agents, that states:<sup>1</sup>

WARNING: This product contains DEHP, a phthalate chemical known to the State of California to cause birth defects and other reproductive harm.

(c) **Point-of-Sale Warnings.** Cost Plus may perform its warning obligations by ensuring that signs are posted at retail outlets in the State of California where the Products are sold. Point-of-sale warnings shall be provided through one or more signs posted in close proximity to the point of display of the Products that states:

WARNING: This product contains DEHP, a phthalate chemical known to the State of California to cause birth defects and other reproductive harm.

Where more than one Product is sold in proximity to other like items or to those that do not require a warning (e.g., Phthalate Free as defined in Section 2.1), the following statement must be used:

WARNING: The following products contain DEHP, a phthalate chemical known to the State of California to cause birth defects and other reproductive harm:

[list products for which warning is required]

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> For purposes of this Settlement Agreement, "sold in proximity to other like items" shall mean that the Product and another product are offered for sale close enough to each other so that the consumer, under customary conditions of purchase, could not reasonably determine which of the two products is subject to the warning sign.

- 2.4 <u>Warnings For Internet Sales.</u> Cost Plus shall satisfy its warning obligations for Products sold via the Internet to California residents by providing a warning on the website.

  Warnings given on the website shall identify the specific Product to which the warning applies as further specified in sub sections (a) below.
- (a) <u>Internet Website Warning</u>. A warning may be given in conjunction with the sale of the Product via the Internet, provided it appears either: (a) on the same web page on which the Product is displayed; (b) on the same web page as the order form for the Product; (c) on the same page as the price for any Product; or (d) on one or more web pages displayed to a purchaser during the checkout process. The following warning statement shall be used and shall appear in any of the above instances adjacent to or immediately following the display, description, or price of the Product for which it is given in the same type size or larger than the Product description text:

**WARNING:** This product contains DEHP, a phthalate chemical known to the State of California to cause birth defects and other reproductive harm.

Alternatively, the designated symbol may appear adjacent to or immediately following the display, description, or price of the Product for which a warning is being given, provided that the following warning statement also appears elsewhere on the same web page, as follows:

WARNING: Products identified on this page with the following symbol ▼ contain DEHP, a phthalate chemical known to the State of California to cause birth defects and other reproductive harm.

# 2.5 Exceptions To Warning Requirements

The warning requirements set forth in Sections 2.2 through 2.3 shall not apply to:

- (i) Any Products received before the Effective Date; or
- (ii) Phthalate Free Products (as defined in Section 2.1).

# 2.6 Sales of the Fabric Doctor Kit (Bag), SKU 3985995

The parties agree that the Fabric Doctor Kit identified in Held's Supplemental Notice contains DEHP only in the plastic bag containing the Doctor Kit. As such, Cost Plus may continue to sell these products without a warning only if the contents of the Kit are sold without the plastic bag currently containing the Kit. Alternatively, Cost Plus may sell the Kit without warnings if the Kit is sold in a bag or container which contains no measurable amount of DEHP.

# 3. PENALTIES PURSUANT TO HEALTH & SAFETY CODE §25249.7(B)

In settlement of all the claims referred to in this Settlement Agreement against it, Cost
Plus shall pay \$2,000 in civil penalties to be apportioned in accordance with California Health &
Safety Code \$25192, with 75% of these funds remitted to the State of California's Office of
Environmental Health Hazard Assessment and the remaining 25% of these penalty monies
remitted to Held as provided by California Health & Safety Code \$25249.12(d). Cost Plus shall
issue two separate checks for the penalty payment: (a) one check made payable to Hirst &
Chanler LLP in Trust for the State of California's Office of Environmental Health Hazard
Assessment (OEHHA) in the amount of \$1,500, representing 75% of the total penalty and (b)
one check to Hirst & Chanler LLP in Trust for Held in the amount of \$500, representing 25% of
the total penalty. Two separate 1099s shall be issued for the above payments: The first 1099
shall be issued to OEHHA, P.O. Box 4010, Sacramento, CA 95814 (EIN: 68-0284486) in the

amount of \$1,500. The second 1099 shall be issued to Held in the amount of \$500, whose address and tax identification number shall be furnished, upon request, five calendar days before payment is due. The payments shall be delivered on or before August 27, 2008, at the following address:

HIRST & CHANLER LLP Attn: Proposition 65 Controller Capitol Mall Complex 455 Capitol Mall, Suite 605 Sacramento, CA 95814

# 4. REIMBURSEMENT OF FEES AND COSTS

The parties reached an accord on the compensation due to Held and his counsel under the private attorney general doctrine and principles of contract law. Under these legal principles, Cost Plus shall reimburse Held's counsel for fees and costs, incurred as a result of investigating, bringing this matter to Cost Plus's attention, and negotiating a settlement in the public interest. Cost Plus shall pay Held and his counsel \$23,000 for all attorneys' fees, expert and investigation fees, and related costs. The payment of \$23,000 shall be made payable to Hirst & Chanler LLP and shall be delivered on or before August 27, 2008, at the following address:

HIRST & CHANLER llp
Attn: Proposition 65 Controller
Capitol Mall Complex
455 Capitol Mall, Suite 605
Sacramento, CA 95814

Cost Plus shall issue a separate 1099 for fees and cost paid in the amount of \$23,000 to Hirst & Chanler LLP, 455 Capitol Mall, Suite 605, Sacramento, CA 95814 (EIN: 20-3929984).

#### 5. RELEASE OF ALL CLAIMS

### 5.1 Release of Cost Plus and Downstream Customers

In further consideration of the promises and agreements herein contained, and for the payments to be made pursuant to Sections 3 and 4 above, Held, on behalf of himself, his past and current agents, representatives, attorneys, successors and/or assignees, and in the interest of the general public, hereby waives all rights to institute or participate in, directly or indirectly, any form of legal action and releases all claims, including, without limitation, all actions, and causes of action, in law or in equity, suits, liabilities, demands, obligations, damages, costs, fines, penalties, losses or expenses (including, but not limited to, investigation fees, expert fees and attorneys' fees) of any nature whatsoever, whether known or unknown, fixed or contingent (collectively "Claims"), against Cost Plus and each of its downstream distributors, wholesalers, licensors, licensees, auctioneers, retailers, franchisees, dealers, customers, owners, purchasers, users, parent companies, corporate affiliates, subsidiaries, and their respective officers, directors, attorneys, representatives, shareholders, agents, and employees, and sister and parent entities (collectively "Releasees"). This release is limited to those claims that arise under Proposition 65, as such claims relate to Cost Plus's alleged failure to warn about exposures to or identification of the Listed Chemical contained in children's products including the Products.

The Parties further understand and agree that this release shall not extend upstream to any entities that manufactured the Products or any component parts thereof, or any distributors or suppliers who sold the Products or any component parts thereof to Cost Plus.

### 5.2 Cost Plus's Release of Held

Cost Plus waives any and all claims against Held, his attorneys and other representatives, for any and all actions taken or statements made (or those that could have been taken or made) by Held and his attorneys and other representatives, whether in the course of investigating claims or otherwise seeking enforcement of Proposition 65 against it in this matter, and/or with respect to the Products.

#### 6. SEVERABILITY

If, subsequent to the execution of this Settlement Agreement, any of the provisions of this Settlement Agreement are held by a court to be unenforceable, the validity of the enforceable provisions remaining shall not be adversely affected.

#### 7. GOVERNING LAW

The terms of this Settlement Agreement shall be governed by the laws of the State of California and apply within the State of California. In the event that Proposition 65 is repealed or is otherwise rendered inapplicable by reason of law generally, or as to the Products, then Cost Plus shall provide written notice to Held of any asserted change in the law, and shall have no further obligations pursuant to this Settlement Agreement with respect to, and to the extent that, the Products are so affected.

#### 8. NOTICES

Unless specified herein, all correspondence and notices required to be provided pursuant to this Settlement Agreement shall be in writing and personally delivered or sent by: (i) first-class, (registered or certified mail) return receipt requested; or (ii) overnight courier on any party

by the other party at the following addresses:

## To Cost Plus:

Jane Baughman
Executive Vice President, CFO
Cost Plus, Inc.
200 4<sup>th</sup> Street
Oakland, CA 94607

#### To Held:

Proposition 65 Coordinator Hirst & Chanler, LLP 2560 Ninth Street Parker Plaza, Suite 214 Berkeley, CA 94710-2565

Any party, from time to time, may specify in writing to the other party a change of address to which all notices and other communications shall be sent.

## 9. COUNTERPARTS; FACSIMILE SIGNATURES

This Settlement Agreement may be executed in counterparts and by facsimile, each of which shall be deemed an original, and all of which, when taken together, shall constitute one and the same document.

# 10. COMPLIANCE WITH HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 25249.7(f)

Held agrees to comply with the reporting form requirements referenced in Health & Safety Code §25249.7(f).

### 11. MODIFICATION

This Settlement Agreement may be modified only by a written agreement of the Parties.

### 12. ATTORNEY'S FEES

In the event a dispute arises with respect to any provision of this Agreement, the prevailing party shall be entitled to recover reasonable costs and attorneys' fees incurred in connection with such dispute.

# 13. <u>AUTHORIZATION</u>

The undersigned are authorized to execute this Settlement Agreement on behalf of their respective Parties and have read, understood and agree to all of the terms and conditions of this Settlement Agreement.

AGREED TO: Date:	Date: 8/20/08 AGREED TO:
By:Anthony Held	By: Mus Mus Sane Baughman, Executive Vice President, CFO Cost Plus, Inc.
APPROVED AS TO FORM:	APPROVED AS TO FORM:
Date: 8/26/85 HIRST & CHANLER LLP	Date: 8/20/08  COOPER, WHITE & COOPER, LLP
By: Daniel Bornstein	By: Marcy J. Bergman
Attorneys for Anthony Held	Attorneys for Cost Plus, Inc.

# 13. <u>AUTHORIZATION</u>

The undersigned are authorized to execute this Settlement Agreement on behalf of their respective Parties and have read, understood and agree to all of the terms and conditions of this Settlement Agreement.

AGREED TO:  Date: APPROVED  By Anthony E Held at 9:43 am, 8/21/08  By: Anthony Held  Anthony Held	AGREED TO:  Date:  By:  Jane Baughman, Executive Vice President, CFO Cost Plus , Inc.
APPROVED AS TO FORM:	APPROVED AS TO FORM:
Date:	Date:
HIRST & CHANLER LLP	COOPER, WHITE & COOPER, LLP
By: Daniel Bornstein Attorneys for Anthony Held	By: Marcy J. Bergman Attorneys for Cost Plus, Inc.