1 2 3 4	Troy C. Bailey, State Bar No. 277424 Stephen E. Cohen, State Bar No. 284416 THE CHANLER GROUP 2560 Ninth Street, Suite 214 Berkeley, CA 94710 Telephone: (510) 848-8880 Facsimile: (510) 848-8118	
5	Attorneys for Plaintiff RUSSELL BRIMER	
7	SUPERIOR COURT OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA	
8	COUNTY OF MARIN	
9	UNLIMITED CIVIL JURISDICTION	
10		
11	RUSSELL BRIMER,	Case No. CIV 1301293
12	Plaintiff,	
13	v.	[PROPOSED] CONSENT JUDGMENT
14	DELUXE CORPORATION; DIRECT	
15	CHECKS UNLIMITED, LLC; and DOES 1-150, inclusive,	
16	Defendants.	
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		
26		
27		
28	[PROPOSED] CO	ONSENT JUDGMENT
	[FROI OSED] CO	

# 

# 

#### 

#### 

# 

# 

# 

### 

# 

# 

#### 

## 

# 

# 

## 

## 

# 

# 

## \_-

# 

## 

## 

### 

#### 

#### 1. <u>INTRODUCTION</u>

#### 1.1 Russell Brimer and Deluxe Corporation

This Consent Judgment is entered into by and between plaintiff Russell Brimer ("Brimer" or "Plaintiff") and defendant Deluxe Corporation ("Deluxe" or "Defendant"), with Plaintiff and Defendant collectively referred to as the "Parties" and each individually referred to as a "Party."

#### 1.2 Plaintiff

Brimer is an individual residing in California who seeks to promote awareness of exposures to toxic chemicals and improve human health by reducing or eliminating hazardous substances in consumer products.

#### 1.3 Defendant

Deluxe employs ten or more persons and is a person in the course of doing business for purposes of the Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986, California Health & Safety Code § 25249.6 *et seq.* ("Proposition 65").

#### 1.4 General Allegations

Brimer alleges that Deluxe manufactured, imported, distributed, sold and/or offered for sale checkbook covers with vinyl/PVC components containing di(2-ethylhexyl)phthalate ("DEHP") in the State of California without the requisite Proposition 65 health hazard warnings. DEHP is listed pursuant to Proposition 65 as known to the State of California to cause birth defects and other reproductive harm.

#### 1.5 Product Description

The products that are covered by this Consent Judgment are defined as checkbook covers with vinyl/PVC components containing DEHP including, but not limited to, the *Burgundy Leather Tri-fold*, #228275, which Deluxe manufactured, imported, distributed, sold or offered for sale in the State of California, hereinafter referred to as the "Covered Products."

# 

### 

#### **1.6** Notice of Violation

On August 31, 2012, Brimer served Deluxe and various public enforcement agencies with a document entitled "60-Day Notice of Violation" ("Notice") that provided the recipients with notice of alleged violations of Proposition 65 for failing to warn consumers that the Covered Products exposed users in California to DEHP. To the best of the Parties' knowledge, no public enforcer has commenced and is diligently prosecuting the allegations set forth in the Notice.

#### 1.7 Complaint

On or about March 27, 2013, Brimer, who was and is acting in the interest of the general public in California, filed a complaint ("Complaint" or "Action") in the Superior Court in and for the County of Marin against Deluxe and Does 1 through 150, alleging, *inter alia*, for violations of Proposition 65 based on the alleged exposures to DEHP contained in the Covered Products.

#### 1.8 No Admission

Deluxe denies the material, factual and legal allegations contained in Brimer's Notice and Complaint and maintains that all Covered Products sold and distributed in California have been and are in compliance with all laws. Nothing in this Consent Judgment shall be construed as an admission by Deluxe of any fact, finding, issue of law, or violation of law; nor shall compliance with this Consent Judgment constitute or be construed as an admission by Deluxe of any fact, finding, issue of law, or violation of law, such being specifically denied by Deluxe. However, this Section shall not diminish or otherwise affect Deluxe's obligations, responsibilities, and duties under this Consent Judgment.

#### 1.9 Consent to Jurisdiction

For purposes of this Consent Judgment only, the Parties stipulate that this Court has jurisdiction over Deluxe as to the allegations contained in the Complaint, that venue is proper in the County of Marin, and that this Court has jurisdiction to enter and enforce the provisions of this Consent Judgment.

# 

#### **1.10** Effective Date

For purposes of this Consent Judgment, the term "Effective Date" shall mean the date that this Consent Judgment is approved by the Court.

#### 2. <u>INJUNCTIVE RELIEF: REFORMULATION AND WARNINGS</u>

#### 2.1 Reformulation Standard

"Reformulated Products" shall mean Covered Products containing less than 1,000 parts per million (0.1%) of DEHP in each Accessible Component when analyzed pursuant to U.S. Environmental Protection Agency testing methodologies 3580A and 8270C or any other methodology utilized by federal or state agencies for the purpose of determining the DEHP content in a solid substance. For purposes of this Consent Judgment "Accessible Component" shall mean a component of a Covered Product that can be touched by a person during normal, intended and foreseeable use of the Covered Product.

#### 2.2 <u>Reformulation Commitment</u>

Commencing on January 1, 2014, Deluxe shall not distribute, import, sell and/or offer for sale any Covered Product in the State of California unless such Covered Product is a Reformulated Product, or, alternatively, unless such Covered Product contains clear and reasonable warnings as set forth below.

#### 2.3 Warnings Commitment

The Parties acknowledge that Deluxe has already implemented a warning program for non-Reformulated Products manufactured, imported, distributed, sold and/or offered for sale by Deluxe in California. Deluxe shall continue to use said warnings on non-Reformulated Products sold in California through and until August 31, 2014. However, commencing on or before September 1, 2014, Deluxe shall provide clear and reasonable warnings as set forth in subsections 2.3(a) and (b) for all non-Reformulated Products sold in California. Each warning shall be prominently placed with such conspicuousness as compared with other words, statements, designs, or devices as to render it likely to be read and understood by an ordinary individual under customary conditions before purchase or use. Each warning shall be provided

in a manner such that the consumer or user understands which *specific* Covered Product the warning applies, so as to minimize the risk of consumer confusion.

#### (a) Non-Internet or Catalog Sales.

(i) **Product Labeling.** Deluxe shall affix a warning directly on each Covered Product, or include a paper insert within the package that contains a Covered Product, sold to consumers in California by Deluxe or any person selling the Covered Products, that states:

**WARNING:** This product contains chemicals, including DEHP, known to the State of California to cause cancer, birth defects and other reproductive harm.

#### (b) Mail Order Catalog and Internet Sales.

In the event that Deluxe sells Covered Products via mail order catalog and/or the internet, to customers located in California, after January 1, 2014, that are not Reformulated Products, Deluxe shall provide warnings for such Covered Products. Warnings given in the mail order catalog or on the internet shall identify the *specific* Covered Product to which the warning applies as further specified in Sections 2.3(b)(i) and (ii).

#### (i) Mail Order Catalog Warning.

Any warning provided in a mail order catalog shall be in the same type size or larger than the Covered Product description text within the catalog. The following warning shall be provided on the same page and in the same location as the display and/or description of the Covered Product:

WARNING: This product contains chemicals, including DEHP, known to the State of California to cause cancer, birth defects and other reproductive harm.

#### (ii) Internet Website Warning.

In addition to the warnings required in Section 2.3(a)(i), a warning may be given in conjunction with the sale of the Covered Products via the internet, which warning shall appear either: (a) on the same web page on which a Covered Product is displayed; (b) on the same web

page as the order form for a Covered Product; (c) on the same page as the price for any Covered Product; or (d) on one or more web pages displayed to a purchaser during the checkout process. The following warning statement shall be used and shall appear in any of the above instances adjacent to or immediately following the display, description, or price of the Covered Product for which it is given in the same type size or larger than the Covered Product description text:

WARNING: This product contains chemicals, including DEHP, known to the State of California to cause cancer, birth defects and other reproductive harm.

For Covered Products purchased through a catalog, via the internet, by telephone or any other method by which the Covered Product is shipped to the purchaser, and for which Defendant provides a warning via the method outlined in Section 2.3(a)(i), Deluxe shall include language on the warning which informs the purchaser that he or she may return the Covered Product for a full refund (including shipping costs for both the receipt and return of the product), within 30 days of purchase.

### 3. PENALTIES PURSUANT TO HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 25249.7(b)

In settlement of all the claims referred to in this Consent Judgment, Deluxe shall pay a total of \$135,000 in civil penalties in accordance with this Section. Each penalty payment will be allocated in accordance with California Health & Safety Code §§ 25249.12(c)(1) & (d), with 75% of the funds remitted to the California Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment ("OEHHA") and the remaining 25% of the penalty remitted to Brimer, as follows:

#### 3.1 Initial Civil Penalty

Deluxe shall pay an initial civil penalty in the amount of \$20,000 on or before January 29, 2014. Deluxe shall issue two separate checks to: (a) "OEHHA" in the amount of \$15,000; and (b) "The Chanler Group in Trust for Russell Brimer" in the amount of \$5,000. All penalty payments shall be delivered to the addresses listed in Section 3.6 below.

## 

#### 3.2 Payment in Lieu of Civil Penalty

Deluxe shall pay the sum of \$10,000 to Silent Spring Institute ("Silent Spring"), a not-for-profit institution, in lieu of further additional initial civil penalties pursuant to Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(b), and California Code of Regulations, Title 11, § 3202(b), on or before the Effective Date. Silent Spring will use such funds to continue its work identifying the links between exposure to environmental chemicals, including DEHP, and reproductive and developmental harm, as well as educating the public about such potential exposures. Silent Spring will conduct exposure- and risk-based prioritization of chemicals listed under Proposition 65, or chemicals OEHHA has identified as candidates for listing, in order to identify exposures of potential public health significance. Silent Spring may also use a portion of such funds to monitor compliance with the reformulation and warnings requirements of this and other similar consent judgments addressing Proposition 65-listed chemical exposures, as well as to conduct additional exposure measurements that evaluate the levels of chemical exposures to users of products that contain phthalate chemicals and lead.

#### 3.3 Second Civil Penalty

Deluxe shall pay a second civil penalty of \$50,000 on or before June 15, 2014. The second civil penalty shall be waived in its entirety, however, if, no later than June 1, 2014, an officer of Deluxe provides Brimer with written certification that, as of the date of such certification and continuing into the future, Deluxe has met the reformulation standard specified in Section 2.1 above, such that no less than fifty percent (50%) of the Covered Products manufactured, imported, distributed, sold and/or offered for sale in California by Deluxe are Reformulated Products. The certification in lieu of a second civil penalty payment provided by this Section is a material term, and time is of the essence. The certification shall also state that Deluxe has administered its own independent testing of the Covered Products verifying that the Covered Products are Reformulated Products. Deluxe's independent testing shall consist of sampling of multiple units of Covered Products from each manufacturer and/or distributor at intervals reasonably necessary to ensure that the Covered Products comply with the

of \$12,500.

3.4 Third Civil Penalty

Deluxe shall pay a third civil penalty of \$35,000 on or before January 15, 2015. The third civil penalty shall be waived in its entirety, however, if, no later than January 1, 2015, an officer of Deluxe provides Brimer with written certification that, as of the date of such certification and continuing on into the future, Deluxe has met the reformulation standard specified in Section 2.1 above, such that no less than seventy percent (70%) of the Covered Products manufactured, imported, distributed, sold and/or offered for sale in California by Deluxe are Reformulated Products. The certification in lieu of a third civil penalty payment provided by this Section is a material term, and time is of the essence. The certification shall comply with the additional requirements regarding independent testing of the Covered Products described in Section 3.3 above. Deluxe shall issue two separate checks for its third civil penalty payment to: (a) "OEHHA" in the amount of \$26,250; and (b) "The Chanler Group in Trust for Russell Brimer" in the amount of \$8,750.

reformulation standard. The independent test results obtained by Deluxe verifying that the

Covered Products are Reformulated Products shall be made available to Brimer at his request

and any such test results shall not be disclosed by Brimer or his counsel to any person, nor shall

any such test results be used for any purpose other than to enforce the provisions of this Section.

Deluxe shall issue two separate checks for its second civil penalty payment to: (a) "OEHHA" in

the amount of \$37,500; and (b) "The Chanler Group in Trust for Russell Brimer" in the amount

#### 3.5 Final Civil Penalty

Deluxe shall pay a final civil penalty of \$20,000 on or before June 15, 2015. The final civil penalty shall be waived in its entirety, however, if, no later than June 1, 2015, an officer of Deluxe provides Brimer with written certification that, as of the date of such certification and continuing on into the future, Deluxe has met the reformulation standard specified in Section 2.1 above, such that no less than ninety percent (90%) of the Covered Products manufactured, imported, distributed, sold and/or offered for sale in California by Deluxe are Reformulated

1	Products. The certification in lieu of a final civil penalty payment provided by this Section is a	
2	material term, and time is of the essence. The certification shall comply with the additional	
3	requirements regarding independent testing of the Covered Products described in Section 3.3	
4	above. The independent testing requirements provided in Section 3.3 above shall continue until	
5	January 15, 2016 and Brimer shall retain the right to request and receive any test results until	
6	June 15, 2016. Following June 15, 2016, Deluxe will have no obligation to provide test results	
7	to Brimer, except as otherwise required by law. Deluxe shall issue two separate checks for its	
8	final civil penalty payment to: (a) "OEHHA" in the amount of \$15,000; and (b) "The Chanler	
9	Group in Trust for Russell Brimer' in the amount of \$5,000.	
10	3.6 Payment Procedures	
11	<b>3.6.1 Issuance of Payments</b> . Payments shall be delivered as follows:	
12	(a) All payments owed to Brimer, pursuant to Sections 3.1, 3.3, 3.4	
13	and 3.5 and the payment owed to Silent Spring shall be delivered to the following payment	
14	address:	
15	The Chanler Group Attn: Proposition 65 Controller	
16 17	2560 Ninth Street Parker Plaza, Suite 214 Berkeley, CA 94710	
18	(b) All payments owed to OEHHA (EIN: 68-0284486), pursuant to	
19	Sections 3.1, 3.3, 3.4 and 3.5 shall be delivered directly to OEHHA (Memo line "Prop 65"	
20	Penalties") at the following addresses:	
21	For U.S. Postal Service Delivery: For Non-U.S. Postal Service Delivery:	
22	Mike Gyurics  Mike Gyurics	
23	Fiscal Operations Branch Chief Office of Envt'l Health Hazard Assessment  Fiscal Operations Branch Chief Office of Envt'l Health Hazard Assessment	
24	P.O. Box 4010 1001 I Street	
25	Sacramento, CA 95812-4010 Sacramento, CA 95814	
26	With a copy of the checks payable to OEHHA mailed to The Chanler Group at the address	
27	set forth above in 3.6.1(a), as proof of payment to OEHHA.	

# 

3.6.2 Issuance of 1099 Forms. After each penalty payment, Deluxe shall issue separate 1099 forms for each payment to Brimer, whose address and tax identification number shall be furnished upon request after this Consent Judgment has been fully executed by the Parties, and OEHHA at the addresses listed in Section 3.6.1 above.

#### 4. REIMBURSEMENT OF FEES AND COSTS

The Parties acknowledge that Brimer and his counsel offered to resolve this dispute without reaching terms on the amount of fees and costs to be reimbursed to them, thereby leaving this fee issue to be resolved after the material terms of the agreement had been settled. Brimer then expressed a desire to resolve the fee and cost issue shortly after the other settlement terms had been finalized. The Parties then attempted to (and did) reach an accord on the compensation due to Brimer and his counsel under general contract principles and the private attorney general doctrine codified at California Code of Civil Procedure § 1021.5, for all work performed through the mutual execution of this agreement. Deluxe shall pay \$94,500 for fees and costs incurred as a result of investigating, bringing this matter to Deluxe's attention, and negotiating a settlement in the public interest. Deluxe shall issue a separate 1099 for fees and costs (EIN: 94-3171522), shall make the check payable to "The Chanler Group" and shall deliver payment on or before January 29, 2014, to the address listed in Section 3.6.1 above.

#### 5. <u>CLAIMS COVERED AND RELEASED</u>

### 5.1 <u>Brimer's Public Release of Proposition 65 Claims</u>

In consideration of the promises and commitments herein contained, Brimer on behalf of himself and his past and current agents, representatives, attorneys, successors, and/or assignees, and in the public interest, hereby waive and release Deluxe, all of its parents, subsidiaries, affiliated entities that are under common ownership or control, and their directors, officers, employees, and attorneys ("Releasees") and each entity to whom they directly or indirectly distribute or sell Covered Products, including, but not limited to, all distributors, wholesalers, customers, retailers, franchisees, cooperative members, licensors, and licensees ("Downstream Releasees"), from all claims for violations of Proposition 65 based on exposure to DEHP from

Covered Products arising up through the Effective Date. This waiver and release is limited to those claims that arise under Proposition 65 with respect to DEHP in the Covered Products associated with Deluxe, as such claims relate to the alleged failure to warn under Health & Safety Code § 25249.6 and apply only as to Covered Products. Compliance with the terms of this Consent Judgment constitutes compliance with Proposition 65 with respect to exposures to DEHP from the Covered Products as set forth in the Notice.

#### 5.2 <u>Brimer's Individual Release of Claims</u>

Brimer also, in his individual capacity only and *not* in his representative capacity, provides a release herein which shall be effective as a full and final accord and satisfaction, as a bar to all actions, causes of action, obligations, costs, expenses, attorneys' fees, damages, losses, claims, liabilities and demands of plaintiff of any nature, character or kind, whether known or unknown, suspected or unsuspected, limited to and arising out of alleged or actual exposures to DEHP in the Covered Products manufactured, imported, distributed, sold and/or offered for sale by Deluxe.

#### 5.3 Deluxe's Release of Brimer

Deluxe on behalf of itself, its past and current agents, representatives, attorneys, successors, and/or assignees, hereby waives any and all claims against Brimer, his attorneys and other representatives, for any and all actions taken or statements made (or those that could have been taken or made) by Brimer and his attorneys and other representatives, whether in the course of investigating claims or otherwise seeking to enforce Proposition 65 against it in this matter with respect to the Covered Products.

#### 6. <u>COURT APPROVAL</u>

This Consent Judgment is not effective until it is approved and entered by the court and shall be null and void if, for any reason, it is not approved and entered by the Court within one year after it has been fully executed by all Parties, in which event any monies that have been provided to Brimer or his counsel pursuant to Sections 3 and 4 above, shall be refunded within fifteen (15) days after receiving written notice from Deluxe that the one-year period has expired.

#### 7. SEVERABILITY

If, subsequent to the execution of this Consent Judgment, any of the provisions of this Consent Judgment are held by a court to be unenforceable, the validity of the enforceable provisions remaining shall not be adversely affected.

#### 8. GOVERNING LAW

The terms of this Consent Judgment shall be governed by the laws of the State of California and apply within the State of California. In the event that Proposition 65 is repealed or is otherwise rendered inapplicable by reason of law generally, or as to the Covered Products, then Deluxe shall provide written notice to Brimer of any asserted change in the law, and shall have no further obligations pursuant to this Consent Judgment with respect to, and to the extent that, the Covered Products are so affected.

#### 9. NOTICES

Unless specified herein, all correspondence and notices required to be provided pursuant to this Consent Judgment shall be in writing and personally delivered or sent by: (i) first-class, (registered or certified mail) return receipt requested; or (ii) overnight courier on any Party by the other Party at the following addresses:

To Deluxe: To Brimer:

Peter J. Godich	Proposition 65 Coordinator
Senior VP, Fulfillment	The Chanler Group
Deluxe Corporation	2560 Ninth Street
3680 Victoria Street North	Parker Plaza, Suite 214
Shoreview, MN 55126	Berkeley, CA 94710

Notices to Deluxe should be copied to:

Sharon Rowe	William F. Tarantino
General Counsel	Morrison & Foerster LLP
Deluxe Corporation	425 Market Street, Suite 3300
3680 Victoria Street North	San Francisco, CA 94105
Shoreview, MN 55126	

Any Party, from time to time, may specify in writing to the other Party a change of address to which all notices and other communications shall be sent.

#### 10. COUNTERPARTS; FACSIMILE SIGNATURES

This Consent Judgment may be executed in counterparts and by facsimile or portable document format (".pdf"), each of which shall be deemed an original, and all of which, when taken together, shall constitute one and the same document. A facsimile or .pdf signature shall be as valid as the original.

#### 11. COMPLIANCE WITH HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 25249.7(f)

Brimer agrees to comply with the reporting form requirements referenced in California Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(f).

#### 12. ADDITIONAL POST EXECUTION ACTIVITIES

The Parties agree to mutually employ their, and their counsel's, reasonable best efforts to support the entry of this agreement as a Consent Judgment and obtain approval of the Consent Judgment by the Court in a timely manner. The Parties acknowledge that, pursuant to California Health & Safety Code § 25249.7, a noticed motion is required to obtain judicial approval of this Consent Judgment, which Brimer shall file, and which Deluxe shall not oppose. If any third party objection to the noticed motion is filed, Brimer and Deluxe shall work together to file a joint reply and appear at any hearing before the Court. If the Court does not approve the motion to approve this Consent Judgment, and the Parties choose not to pursue a modified Consent Judgment within 30 days of said denial, or in the event that the Court approve this Consent Judgment and any person successfully appeals that approval, all payments made pursuant to this Consent Judgment will be returned to Deluxe with interest at the prevailing Federal Funds rate.

#### 13. MODIFICATION

This Consent Judgment may be modified only: (1) by written agreement of the Parties and upon entry of a modified Consent Judgment by the Court thereon; or (2) upon a successful motion of any Party and entry of a modified Consent Judgment by the court.

#### 14. ENTIRE AGREEMENT

This Consent Judgment contains the sole and entire agreement and understanding of the Parties with respect to the entire subject matter hereof, and any and all prior discussions, negotiations, commitments, and understandings related hereto. No representations, oral or otherwise, express or implied, other than those contained herein have been made by any party hereto. No other agreements not specifically referred to herein, oral or otherwise, shall be deemed to exist or to bind any of the Parties.

#### 15. AUTHORIZATION

The undersigned are authorized to execute this Consent Judgment on behalf of their respective parties and have read, understood, and agree to all of the terms and conditions of this Consent Judgment.

AGREED TO:	AGREED TO:
Date: January 2, 2014	Date:
By:	Ву:
Russell Brimer	Deluxe Corporation

#### 14. ENTIRE AGREEMENT

This Consent Judgment contains the sole and entire agreement and understanding of the Parties with respect to the entire subject matter hereof, and any and all prior discussions, negotiations, commitments, and understandings related hereto. No representations, oral or otherwise, express or implied, other than those contained herein have been made by any party hereto. No other agreements not specifically referred to herein, oral or otherwise, shall be deemed to exist or to bind any of the Parties.

#### 15. AUTHORIZATION

AGREED TO:

The undersigned are authorized to execute this Consent Judgment on behalf of their respective parties and have read, understood, and agree to all of the terms and conditions of this Consent Judgment.

AGREED TO:

Date:	Date: 1/27/2014
By:	By: Lete Hobil
Russell Brimer	Peter J. Godich
	Deluxe Corporation