# SUPPLEMENTAL 60-DAY NOTICE OF VIOLATION

SENT IN COMPLIANCE WITH CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 25249.7(d)

**DATE:** October 25, 2013

 Joseph Zepf, Vice President – Amscan Holdings, Inc.; Amscan, Inc.; Party City Holdings, Inc.; Party City Corporation; Gags & Games, Inc.; Christy's California Attorney General's Office; District Attorney's Office for 58 Counties; and City Attorneys for San Francisco, San Diego, San Jose, Sacramento and Los Angeles

FROM: Anthony E. Held, Ph.D., P.E.

### I. INTRODUCTION

My name is Anthony E. Held. I hold a Doctor of Philosophy degree in Environmental Engineering and I am a registered professional engineer in the State of California. I am a citizen of the State of California acting in the interest of the general public. I seek to promote awareness of exposures to toxic chemicals in products sold in California and, if possible, to improve human health by reducing hazardous substances contained in such items. This Notice is provided to the public agencies listed above pursuant to California Health & Safety Code § 25249.6 *et seq.* ("Proposition 65") and supplements the 60-Day Notice of Violation sent on January 31, 2012. As noted above, notice is also being provided to the alleged violators, Amscan Holdings, Inc., Amscan, Inc., Party City Holdings, Inc., Party City Corporation, Gags & Games, Inc. and Christy's (the "Violators"). The violations covered by this Notice consist of the product exposures, routes of exposure, and types of harm potentially resulting from exposure to the toxic chemicals ("listed chemicals") identified below, as follows:

Product Exposure:	See Section VI. Exhibit A	
Listed Chemicals:	Di(2-ethylhexyl)phthalate ("DEHP"); Di-n-butyl phthalate ("DBP");	
	Lead and/or Lead Compounds; Cadmium and/or Cadmium Compounds;	
	Arsenic (inorganic arsenic compounds and inorganic oxides);	
	Formaldehyde (gas)	
Routes of Exposure:	Ingestion, Dermal, Inhalation	
Types of Harm:	Cancer and/or Birth Defects and Other Reproductive Harm	

## II. NATURE OF ALLEGED VIOLATION (PRODUCT EXPOSURE)

The specific types of products that are causing consumer and occupational exposures in violation of Proposition 65, and that are covered by this Notice, are listed under "Product Category/Type" in Exhibit A in Section VI below. All products within the types covered by this Notice shall be referred to hereinafter as the "products." The sales of these products in California dating as far back as October 25, 2010 are subject to this notice. As a result of the sales of these products, exposures to the listed chemicals have been occurring without clear and reasonable warnings as required by Proposition 65.

Without proper warnings regarding the toxic effects of exposure to the listed chemicals, resulting from contact with the products, California citizens lack the information necessary to make informed decisions on whether and how to eliminate (or reduce) the risk of exposure to the toxic chemicals from the reasonably foreseeable use of the products.

## A. CONSUMER PRODUCT EXPOSURE (DEHP AND DBP)

California citizens, through the act of buying, acquiring or utilizing the products, are exposed to the listed chemicals. Infants, children and/or women of childbearing age ingest the listed chemicals when they, among other activities, place the product, or a portion thereof, into their mouth, or otherwise suck, lick, teethe and/or bite the product thereby allowing the listed chemicals to leach out of the substrate directly into their mouths. Infants, children and/or women of childbearing age ingest the listed chemicals when they, among other activities when they, among other activities, touch the products and transfer the listed chemicals from the products to their mouths through hand-to-mouth activities that may continue to occur for a significant period after contact with the products stops. Infants, children and/or women of childbearing age are exposed to the listed chemicals through direct dermal contact when they, among other activities, handle, touch or otherwise use the products.

## B. CONSUMER PRODUCT EXPOSURE (LEAD, CADMIUM, ARSENIC, AND FORMALDEHYDE)

California consumers, through the act of buying, acquiring or utilizing the products, are exposed to the listed chemicals. By way of example but not limitation, exposures occur when California citizens use, display, clean, repair, pack, unpack, arrange, store or otherwise handle the products. These tasks cause consumers to be exposed directly or indirectly through the routine touching of the parts or portions of the products containing readily available surface amounts of the listed chemicals. Additionally, exposure can occur through the routine touching and ingesting of other materials that are contaminated with the listed chemicals from the products as a result of these tasks. Consumers inhale the listed chemicals when, among other activities, they breathe indoor air with airborne particles that are released from the products containing the listed chemicals. People likely to be exposed include both children and adults.

### III. CONTACT INFORMATION

Please direct all questions concerning this notice to me through my counsel's office at the following address:

Anthony E. Held, Ph.D., P.E. c/o Josh Voorhees The Chanler Group Parker Plaza 2560 Ninth Street, Suite 214 Berkeley, CA 94710 Telephone: (510) 848-8880

## IV. PROPOSITION 65 INFORMATION

For general information concerning the provisions of Proposition 65, please feel free to contact the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment's ("OEHHA") Proposition 65 Implementation Office at (916) 445-6900. For the Violators' reference, I have attached a copy of "Proposition 65: A Summary" which has been prepared by OEHHA.

## V. RESOLUTION OF NOTICED CLAIMS

Based on the allegations set forth in this Notice, I intend to file a citizen enforcement lawsuit against the alleged Violators unless such Violators enter into a binding written agreement to: (1) recall products already sold or undertake best efforts to ensure that the requisite health hazard warnings are provided to those whom have received such products; (2) provide clear and reasonable warnings for products sold in the future or reformulate such products to eliminate the exposures; and (3) pay an appropriate civil penalty based on the factors enumerated in California Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(b). If the alleged Violators are interested in resolving this dispute without resort to time-consuming and expensive litigation, please feel free to contact my counsel identified in Section III above. It should be noted that neither my counsel nor I can: (1) finalize any settlement until after the 60-day notice period has expired; nor (2) speak for the Attorney General or any District or City Attorney who received this Notice. Therefore, while reaching an agreement with me will resolve my claims, such agreement may not satisfy the public prosecutors.

	VI.	EXHIBIT A
--	-----	-----------

Product Category/Type	Such As	Toxins
Halloween Costumes containing		Di(2-ethylhexyl)phthalate;
one or more of the chemicals listed		Di-n-butyl phthalate; Lead and/or
herein.		Lead Compounds; Cadmium and/or
		Cadmium Compounds; Arsenic
		(inorganic arsenic compounds and
		inorganic oxides); and/or
		Formaldehyde (gas).
Halloween Costume Accessories,	Deluxe Pirate Boot	Di(2-ethylhexyl)phthalate;
specifically wigs, masks, gloves,	Tops, #7280	Di-n-butyl phthalate; Lead and/or
footwear, belts, bags, hats,	(#757565 127122)	Lead Compounds; Cadmium and/or
costume props, hosiery, weapons		Cadmium Compounds; Arsenic
and jewelry intended to		(inorganic arsenic compounds and
accessorize a costume (but		inorganic oxides); and/or
excluding makeup) containing one		Formaldehyde (gas).
or more of the chemicals listed		
herein.		

## VI. EXHIBIT A (continued)

Product Category/Type	Such As	Toxins
Halloween Indoor and Outdoor		Di(2-ethylhexyl)phthalate;
Home/Party Décor and Games,		Di-n-butyl phthalate; Lead and/or
specifically Halloween candy		Lead Compounds; Cadmium and/or
bowls, lawn, wall, door and table		Cadmium Compounds; Arsenic
ornaments and lights, decorative		(inorganic arsenic compounds and
spiders/webs, lighting, ghosts,		inorganic oxides); and/or
witches, goblins, skeletons, bats,		Formaldehyde (gas).
cats and tombstones containing		
one or more of the chemicals listed		
herein.		

# **PROOF OF SERVICE**

I, the undersigned, declare under penalty of perjury:

I am over the age of 18 years, and not a party to the within action; my business address is Parker Plaza, 2560 Ninth Street, Suite 214, Berkeley, CA 94710.

On October 25, 2013, I served the following documents:

# SUPPLEMENTAL 60-DAY NOTICE OF VIOLATION SENT IN COMPLIANCE WITH HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 25249.7(d);

#### **PROPOSITION 65: A SUMMARY;**

#### **CERTIFICATE OF MERIT; AND**

# CERTIFICATE OF MERIT ATTACHMENTS (SERVED ONLY ON THE ATTORNEY GENERAL)

on the entitues listed below via First Class Certified Mail through the United States Postal Service by placing a true and correct copy in a sealed envelope, addressed to the entities listed below and providing such envelope to a United States Postal Service Representative:

Joseph Zepf, Vice President Amscan Holdings, Inc.; Amscan, Inc.; Party City Holdings, Inc.; Party City Corporation; Gags & Games, Inc.; Christy's 80 Grasslands Road Elmsford, NY 10523

on counsel for such entities listed below via First Class Mail through the United States Postal Service by placing a true and correct copy in a sealed envelope, addressed to such person and providing such envelope to a United States Postal Service Representative:

J. Robert Maxwell Rogers Joseph O'Donnell 311 California Street, 10<sup>th</sup> Floor San Francisco, CA 94104

as well as by providing copies of the above documents electronically uploaded to the public enforcers according to directions from their respective offices, and/or by placing a true and correct copy in a sealed envelope, addressed to each party listed below, and served as follows:

Electronically Uploaded to the Attorney General's website, and sent 2 <sup>nd</sup> Day Air Service by placing such envelope in a Federal Express Drop-Off Box:	The Attorney General of the State of California;
By placing each envelope in a United States Postal Service mailbox, postage prepaid:	The District Attorney for Each of the 58 counties in California; and
	The City Attorney for Los Angeles, San Diego, San Jose, San Francisco and Sacramento

A list of addresses for each of these recipients is attached.

Executed on October 25, 2013, at Berkeley, California.

IM

Caroline Liang

## **CERTIFICATE OF MERIT**

Health and Safety Code Section 25249.7(d)

I, Clifford A. Chanler, hereby declare:

- 1. This Certificate of Merit accompanies the attached sixty-day notice in which it is alleged that the parties identified in the notice have violated Health and Safety Code § 25249.6 by failing to provide clear and reasonable warnings;
- 2. I am the attorney for the noticing party;
- 3. I have consulted with one or more persons with relevant and appropriate experience or expertise who has reviewed facts, studies, or other data regarding the *alleged* exposure to the listed chemicals that is the subject of this action;
- 4. Based on the information obtained through those consultations, and on all other information in my possession, I believe there is a reasonable and meritorious case for the private action. I understand that "reasonable and meritorious case for the private action" means that the information provides a credible basis that all elements of the plaintiff's case can be established and the information did not prove that the alleged Violators will be able to establish any of the affirmative defenses set forth in the statute;
- 5. The copy of this Certificate of Merit served on the Attorney General attaches to it factual information sufficient to establish the basis for this certificate, including information identified in Health and Safety Code § 25249.7(h)(2) (*i.e.*, (1) the identity of the persons consulted with and relied on by the certifier, and (2) the facts, studies, or other data reviewed by those persons).

Dated: October 25, 2013

Clifford A. Chanler

### SERVICE LIST

The Honorable Nancy O'Malley Alameda County District Attorney 1225 Fallon Street, Room 900 Oakland, CA 94612

The Honorable Terese Drabec Alpine County District Attorney 270 Laramie Street, PO BOX 248 Markleeville, CA 96120

The Honorable Todd Riebe Amador County District Attorney 708 Court Street Jackson, CA 95642

The Honorable Michael Ramsey Butte County District Attorney 25 County Center Drive Oroville, CA 95965

The Honorable Barbara Yook Calaveras County District Attorney 891 Mountain Ranch Road San Andreas, CA 95249

The Honorable John R. Poyner Colusa County District Attorney 346 Fifth Street Colusa, CA 95932

The Honorable Mark Peterson Contra Costa County District Attorney 900 Ward Street Martinez, CA 94553

The Honorable Jon Alexander Del Norte County District Attorney 450 H Street, Room 171 Crescent City, CA 95531

The Honorable Vernon Pierson El Dorado County District Attorney 515 Main Street Placerville, CA 95667

The Honorable Elizabeth Egan Fresno County District Attorney 2220 Tulare Street, #1000 Fresno, CA 93721

The Honorable Robert Maloney Glenn County District Attorney P.O. Box 430 Willows, CA 95988

The Honorable Paul Gallegos Humboldt County District Attorney 825 5<sup>th</sup> Street Eureka, CA 95501

The Honorable Gilbert Otero Imperial County District Attorney 940 West Main Street, Suite 102 El Centro, CA 92243

The Honorable Arthur Maillet Inyo County District Attorney P.O. Drawer D Independence, CA 93526

The Honorable Lisa Green Kern County District Attorney 1215 Truxtun Avenue Bakersfield, CA 93301

The Honorable Greg Strickland Kings County District Attorney 1400 West Lacey Boulevard Hanford, CA 93230

The Honorable Donald Anderson Lake County District Attorney 255 North Forbes Street Lakeport, CA 95453 The Honorable Robert Burns Lassen County District Attorney 220 S. Lassen Street, Ste. 8 Susanville, CA 96130

The Honorable Steve Cooley Los Angeles County District Attorney 210 West Temple Street, Suite 18000 Los Angeles, CA 90012

The Honorable Michael Keitz Madera County District Attorney 209 West Yosemite Avenue Madera, CA 93637

The Honorable Edward Berberian Marin County District Attorney 3501 Civic Center Drive, Room 130 San Rafael, CA 94903

The Honorable Robert Brown Mariposa County District Attorney 5101 Jones Street, P.O. Box 730 Mariposa, CA 95338

The Honorable C. David Eyster Mendocino County District Attorney P.O. Box 1000 Ukiah, CA 95482

The Honorable Larry Morse II Merced County District Attorney 550 W. Main Street Merced, CA 95340

The Honorable Gary Woolverton Modoc County District Attorney 204 S. Court Street, Room 202 Alturas, CA 96101

The Honorable George Booth Mono County District Attorney P.O. Box 617 Bridgeport, CA 93517

The Honorable Dean Flippo Monterey County District Attorney P.O. Box 1131 Salinas, CA 93902

The Honorable Gary Lieberstein Napa County District Attorney P.O. Box 720 Napa, CA 94559

The Honorable Clifford Newell Nevada County District Attorney 110 Union Street Nevada City, CA 95959

The Honorable Tony Rackauckas Orange County District Attorney 401 Civic Center Drive West Santa Ana, CA 92701

The Honorable Ronald Owens Placer County District Attorney 10810 Justice Center Drive, Suite 240 Roseville, CA 95678

The Honorable David Hollister Plumas County District Attorney 520 Main Street, Room 404 Quincy, CA 95971

The Honorable Paul Zellerbach Riverside County District Attorney 3960 Orange Street Riverside, CA 92501

The Honorable Jan Scully Sacramento County District Attorney 901 G Street Sacramento, CA 95814 The Honorable Candice Hooper San Benito County District Attorney 419 4<sup>th</sup> Street, Second Floor Hollister, CA 95203

The Honorable Michael Ramos San Bernardino County District Attorney 316 N. Mountain View Avenue San Bernardino, CA 92415

The Honorable Bonnie Dumanis San Diego County District Attorney 330 W. Broadway Street San Diego, CA 92101

The Honorable George Gascon San Francisco County District Attorney 850 Bryant Street, Room 322 San Francisco, CA 94103

The Honorable James Willett San Joaquin County District Attorney P.O. Box 990 Stockton, CA 95201

The Honorable Gerald Shea San Luis Obispo County District Attorney 1035 Palm Street San Luis Obispo, CA 93408

The Honorable Stephen Wagstaffe San Mateo County District Attorney 400 County Center, Third Floor Redwood City, CA 94063

The Honorable Joyce Dudley Santa Barbara County District Attorney 1112 Santa Barbara Street Santa Barbara, CA 93101

The Honorable Jeffrey Rosen Santa Clara County District Attorney 70 West Hedding Street, West Wing San Jose, CA 95110

The Honorable Bob Lee Santa Cruz County District Attorney 701 Ocean Street, Room 200 Santa Cruz, CA 95060

The Honorable Stephen Carlton Shasta County District Attorney 1355 West Street Redding, CA 96001

The Honorable Lawrence Allen Sierra County District Attorney 100 Courthouse Square, Second Floor Downieville, CA 95936

The Honorable James Kirk Andrus Siskiyou County District Attorney P.O. Box 986 Yreka, CA 96097

The Honorable Donald A. du Bain Solano County District Attorney 675 Texas Street, Suite 4500 Fairfield, CA 94533

The Honorable Jill Ravitch Sonoma County District Attorney 600 Administration Drive, Room 212J Santa Rosa, CA 95403

The Honorable Birgit Fladager Stanislaus County District Attorney 832 12<sup>th</sup> Street, Suite 300 Modesto, CA 95354

The Honorable Carl Adams Sutter County District Attorney 446 Second Street Yuba City, CA 95991 The Honorable Gregg Cohen Tehama County District Attorney 444 Oak Street, Room L Red Bluff, CA 96080

The Honorable Michael B. Harper Trinity County District Attorney PO Box 310 Weaverville, CA 96093

The Honorable Phillip Cline Tulare County District Attorney 221 South Mooney Boulevard, Suite 224 Visalia, CA 93291

The Honorable Donald Segerstrom, Jr Tuolumne County District Attorney 423 North Washington Street Sonora, CA 95370

The Honorable Gregory Totten Ventura County District Attorney 800 South Victoria Avenue Ventura, CA 93009

The Honorable Jeff Reisig Yolo County District Attorney 301 Second Street Woodland, CA 95695

The Honorable Patrick McGrath Yuba County District Attorney 215 Fifth Street Marysville, CA 95901

The Honorable Carmen Trutanich Office of the City Attorney, Los Angeles 200 North Main Street Los Angeles, CA 90012

The Honorable Jan Goldsmith Office of the City Attorney, San Diego 1200 Third Avenue, Suite 1620 San Diego, CA 92101

The Honorable Eileen M. Teichert Office of the City Attorney, Sacramento 915 I Street, 4<sup>th</sup> Floor Sacramento, CA 95814

The Honorable Dennis J. Herrera Office of the City Attorney, San Francisco City Hall, Room 234 San Francisco, CA 94102

The Honorable Richard Doyle Office of the City Attorney, San Jose 200 East Santa Clara Street San Jose, CA 95113

Office of the California Attorney General Proposition 65 Enforcement Reporting ATTN: Prop 65 Coordinator 1515 Clay Street, Suite 2000 Oakland, CA 94612-0550