Christopher M. Martin, State Bar No. 186021
Josh Voorhees, State Bar No. 241436
Stephen E. Cohen, State Bar No. 284416
THE CHANLER GROUP
2560 Ninth Street, Suite 214
Berkeley, CA 94710
Telephone: (510) 848-8880
Facsimile: (510) 848-8118
Attorneys for Plaintiff
ANTHONY E. HELD, PH.D., P.E.
David J. Pitman, State Bar No. 172944
FULWIDER PATTON LLP
6060 Center Drive, $10^{\text {th }}$ Floor
Los Angeles, CA 90045
Telephone: (310) 8245555
Facsimile: (310) 8245656

Attorneys for Defendant
ALLTRADE TOOLS LLC.

SUPERIOR COURT OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA COUNTY OF ALAMEDA UNLIMITED CIVIL JURISDICTION

ANTHONY E. HELD, PH.D., P.E.,
Plaintiff,
v.

ALLTRADE TOOLS LLC; and DOES 1-150, inclusive,

Defendants.

Case No. RG14736144
[PROPOSED] CONSENT JUDGMENT

## 1. INTRODUCTION

### 1.1 Anthony E. Held, Ph.D., P.E. and Alltrade Tools LLC

This Consent Judgment is entered into by and between Anthony E. Held, Ph.D., P.E., ("Held") and Alltrade Tools LLC ("Alltrade"), with Held and Alltrade collectively referred to as the "Parties" and each individually referred to as a "Party."

### 1.2 Plaintiff

Held is an individual residing in California who seeks to promote awareness of exposures to toxic chemicals and improve human health by reducing or eliminating hazardous substances contained in consumer products.

### 1.3 Defendant

Alltrade employs ten or more persons and is a person in the course of doing business for purposes of the Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986, California Health \& Safety Code § 25249.6 et seq. ("Proposition 65 ").

### 1.4 General Allegations

Held alleges that Alltrade manufactures, distributes, sells, and/or offers for sale in California stools with vinyl/PVC upholstery containing di(2-ethylhexyl)phthalate ("DEHP") without the requisite Proposition 65 health hazard warning. DEHP is listed pursuant to Proposition 65 as a chemical known to California to cause birth defects and other reproductive harm if human exposure exceeds certain thresholds.

### 1.5 Product Description

The products that are covered by this Consent Judgment are defined as stools with vinyl/PVC upholstery containing DEHP including, but not limited to, the Snap-on Shop Stool, \#870459 (\#0 2890734049 4), which were manufactured, distributed, sold and/or offered for sale in California by Alltrade, hereinafter referred to as the "Products."

### 1.6 Notice of Violation

On or about May 21, 2014, Held served Alltrade and various public enforcement agencies with a document entitled "Supplemental 60-Day Notice of Violation" ("Notice"), alleging that

Alltrade was in violation of Proposition 65 for failing to warn its customers and consumers in California that the Products exposed users to DEHP. To the best of the Parties' knowledge, no public enforcer has commenced and is diligently prosecuting the allegations set forth in the Notice.

### 1.7 Complaint

On or about August 8,2014, Held, who was and is acting in the interest of the general public in California, filed a complaint ("Complaint" or "Action") in the Superior Court in and for the County of Alameda against Alltrade and Does 1 through 150, alleging, inter alia, violations of Proposition 65 based on the alleged exposures to DEHP contained in the Products sold by Alltrade in the State of California.

## $1.8 \quad$ No Admission

Alltrade denies the material, factual, and legal allegations contained in the Notice and Complaint and maintains that all of the products it has manufactured, distributed, sold and/or offered for sale in California, including the Products, have been, and are, in compliance with all laws. Nothing in this Consent Judgment shall be construed as an admission by Alltrade of any fact, finding, conclusion of law, issue of law, or violation of law; nor shall compliance with this Consent Judgment constitute or be construed as an admission by Alltrade of any fact, finding, conclusion of law, issue of law, or violation of law, such being specifically denied by Alltrade. This Section shall not, however, diminish or otherwise affect Alltrade's obligations, responsibilities, and duties under this Consent Judgment.

### 1.9 Consent to Jurisdiction

For purposes of this Consent Judgment only, the Parties stipulate that this Court has jurisdiction over Alltrade as to the allegations contained in the Complaint, that venue is proper in the County of Alameda, and that this Court has jurisdiction to enter and enforce the provisions of this Consent Judgment.

### 1.10 Effective Date

For purposes of this Consent Judgment, the term "Effective Date" shall mean the date this Consent Judgment is approved by the Court.

## 2. INJUNCTIVE RELIEF: REFORMULATION AND WARNINGS

### 2.1 Reformulation Standards and Commitment

Commencing on the Effective Date and continuing thereafter, Alltrade shall only manufacture, distribute, ship, sell, or offer to ship for sale in California Products that are "Reformulated Products" or Products that are affixed with appropriate warning labels pursuant to Section 2.2 below. For purposes of this Consent Judgment, "Reformulated Products" shall mean Products that contain no more than 1,000 parts per million ( $0.1 \%$ ) DEHP in each Accessible Component when analyzed pursuant to EPA testing methodologies 3580A and 8270C, or equivalent methodologies utilized by state or federal agencies for the purpose of determining DEHP content in a solid substance. For purposes of this Consent Judgment, "Accessible Components" shall mean a component of a Product that can be touched by a person during normal, intended and foreseeable use of the Product.

### 2.2 Product Warnings

### 2.2.1 Product Labeling

Any warning provided under Section 2.1 above shall be affixed to the packaging, labeling, or directly on each Product. Each warning shall be prominently placed with such conspicuousness as compared with other words, statements, designs, or devices as to render it likely to be read and understood by an ordinary individual under customary conditions before purchase. Each warning shall be provided in a manner such that the consumer or user understands to which specific Product the warning applies, so as to minimize the risk of consumer confusion. A warning provided pursuant to this Consent Judgment shall state:

WARNING: This product contains DEHP, a chemical known to the State of California to cause birth defects and other reproductive harm.

### 2.2.2 Mail Order Catalog and Internet Website Warning

In the event that Alltrade sells Products via mail order catalog and/or the internet, to customers located in California, after the Effective Date, that are not Reformulated Products, Alltrade shall provide warnings for such Products sold via mail order catalog or the internet to California residents. Warnings given in the mail order catalog or on the internet shall identify the specific Product to which the warning applies as further specified in Sections 2.2.2(i) and (ii).
(i) Mail Order Catalog Warning. Any warning provided in a mail order catalog shall be in the same type size or larger than the Product description text within the catalog. The following warning shall be provided on the same page and in the same location as the display and/or description of the Product:

> WARNING: This product contains DEHP, a chemical known to the State of California to cause birth defects and other reproductive harm.

Where it is impracticable to provide the warning on the same page and in the same location as the display and/or description of the Product, Alltrade may utilize a designated symbol to cross reference the applicable warning and shall define the term "designated symbol" with the following language on the inside of the front cover of the catalog or on the same page as any order form for the Product(s):

> WARNING: Certain products identified with this symbol $\boldsymbol{\nabla}$ and offered for sale in this catalog contain DEHP, a chemical known to the State of California to cause birth defects and other reproductive harm.

The designated symbol must appear on the same page and in close proximity to the display and/or description of the Product. On each page where the designated symbol appears,

Alltrade must provide a header or footer directing the consumer to the warning language and definition of the designated symbol.
(ii) Internet Website Warning. A warning shall be given in conjunction with the sale of the Products via the internet, which warning shall appear either: (a) on the same web page on which a Product is displayed; (b) on the same web page as the order form for a Product; (c) on the same page as the price for any Product; or (d) on one or more web pages displayed to a purchaser during the checkout process. The following warning statement shall be used and shall appear in any of the above instances adjacent to or immediately following the display, description, or price of the Product for which it is given in the same type size or larger than the Product description text:

WARNING: This product contains DEHP, a chemical known to the State of California to cause birth defects and other reproductive harm.

Alternatively, the designated symbol may appear adjacent to or immediately following the display, description, or price of the Product for which a warning is being given, provided that the following warning statement also appears elsewhere on the same web page, as follows:

WARNING: Products identified on this page
with the following symbol $\boldsymbol{\nabla}$ contain DEHP, a chemical known to the State of California to cause birth defects and other reproductive harm.

## 3. PENALTIES PURSUANT TO HEALTH \& SAFETY CODE § 25249.7(b)

In settlement of all the claims referred to in this Consent Judgment, Alltrade shall pay a total of $\$ 14,000$ in civil penalties in accordance with this Section. Each penalty payment will be allocated in accordance with California Health \& Safety Code §§ 25249.12(c)(1) \& (d), with 75\% of the funds remitted to the California Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment ("OEHHA") and the remaining $25 \%$ of the penalty remitted to Held, as follows:

### 3.1 Initial Civil Penalty

Alltrade shall pay an initial civil penalty of $\$ 4,500$ on or before January 1, 2015. Alltrade
shall issue a check in the amount of $\$ 4,500$ to "Fulwider Patton LLP" to be held in trust for OEHHA and Held. Fulwider Patton LLP shall provide The Chanler Group with written confirmation within five (5) days of receipt that the funds have been deposited in a trust account. Within two (2) days of the Effective Date, Fulwider Patton LLP shall issue two separate checks for the initial civil penalty payment to: (a) "OEHHA" in the amount of \$3,375; and (b) "Anthony E. Held, Client Trust Account" in the amount of $\$ 1,125$.

### 3.2 Final Civil Penalty

Alltrade shall pay a final civil penalty of $\$ 9,500$ on or before April 15, 2015, the final civil penalty shall be waived in its entirety, however, if, no later than April 1, 2015, an officer of Alltrade provides Held with written certification that, as of the date of such certification and continuing into the future, Alltrade has met the reformulation standard specified in Section 2.1 above, such that all Products manufactured, distributed, shipped, sold and/or offered to ship for sale in California by Alltrade are Reformulated Products. The certification in lieu of a final civil penalty payment provided by this Section is a material term, and time is of the essence. If Alltrade fails to make the written certification by April 1, 2015, Alltrade shall issue two separate checks for its final civil penalty payments to: (a) "OEHHA" in the amount of $\$ 7,125$; and (b) "Anthony E. Held, Client Trust Account" in the amount of \$2,375.

### 3.3 Payment Procedures

3.3.1 Issuance of Payments. Payments shall be delivered as follows:
(a) All payments owed to Held, pursuant to Sections 3.1 and 3.2, shall be delivered to the following payment address:

The Chanler Group
Attn: Proposition 65 Controller
2560 Ninth Street
Parker Plaza, Suite 214
Berkeley, CA 94710
(b) All payments owed to OEHHA, pursuant to Sections 3.1 and 3.2, shall be delivered directly to OEHHA (Memo line "Prop 65 Penalties") at the following addresses:

For United States Postal Service Delivery:

Mike Gyurics<br>Fiscal Operations Branch Chief<br>Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment<br>P.O. Box 4010<br>Sacramento, CA 95812-4010<br>For Non-United States Postal Service Delivery:<br>Mike Gyurics<br>Fiscal Operations Branch Chief<br>Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment<br>1001 I Street<br>Sacramento, CA 95814

With a copy of the checks payable to OEHHA mailed to The Chanler Group at the address set forth above in 3.3.1(a), as proof of payment to OEHHA.

## 4. REIMBURSEMENT OF FEES AND COSTS

The Parties acknowledge that Held and his counsel offered to resolve this dispute without reaching terms on the amount of fees and costs to be reimbursed to them, thereby leaving this fee issue to be resolved after the material terms of the agreement had been settled. Held then expressed a desire to resolve the fee and cost issue shortly after the other settlement terms had been finalized. The Parties then attempted to (and did) reach an accord on the compensation due to Held and his counsel under general contract principles and the private attorney general doctrine codified at California Code of Civil Procedure § 1021.5, for all work performed through the mutual execution of this agreement. Alltrade shall pay $\$ 35,500$ for fees and costs incurred as a result of investigating, bringing this matter to Alltrade's attention, and negotiating a settlement in the public interest. Alltrade shall issue a check payable to "Fulwider Patton LLP" in the amount of $\$ 35,500$ on or before January 1, 2015. Fulwider Patton LLP shall provide The Chanler Group with written confirmation within five (5) days of receipt that the funds have been deposited in a trust account. Within two (2) days of the Effective Date, Fulwider Patton LLP shall issue a check payable to "The Chanler Group" to the address listed in Section 3.3.1(a) above.

## 5. CLAIMS COVERED AND RELEASED

### 5.1 Held's Public Release of Proposition 65 Claims

Held acting on his own behalf and in the public interest releases Alltrade, its parents, subsidiaries, affiliated entities that are under common ownership, directors, officers, employees, attorneys, and each entity to whom Alltrade directly or indirectly distributes or sells Products, including but not limited to downstream distributors, wholesalers, customers, retailers, franchisees, cooperative members, licensors, and licensees ("Releasees") from all claims for violations of Proposition 65 up through the Effective Date based on exposure to DEHP from the Products. Compliance with the terms of this Consent Judgment constitutes compliance with Proposition 65 with respect to exposures to DEHP from the Products.

### 5.2 Held's Individual Release of Claims

Held also, in his individual capacity only and not in his representative capacity, provides a release herein which shall be effective as a full and final accord and satisfaction, as a bar to all actions, causes of action, obligations, costs, expenses, attorneys' fees, damages, losses, claims, liabilities and demands of Held of any nature, character or kind, whether known or unknown, suspected or unsuspected, limited to and arising out of any violation of Proposition 65 regarding the failure to warn about exposure to DEHP in the Products manufactured, distributed, sold and/or offered for sale by Releasees.

### 5.3 Alltrade's Release of Held

Alltrade on behalf of itself, its past and current agents, representatives, attorneys, successors, and/or assignees, hereby waives any and all claims against Held, his attorneys and other representatives, for any and all actions taken or statements made (or those that could have been taken or made) by Held and his attorneys and other representatives, whether in the course of investigating claims or otherwise seeking to enforce Proposition 65 against it in this matter with respect to the Products.

## 6. COURT APPROVAL

This Consent Judgment is not effective until it is approved and entered by the Court and shall be null and void if, for any reason, it is not approved and entered by the Court within one year after it has been fully executed by all Parties, in which event any monies that have been provided to Held or his counsel pursuant to Section 3 and 4 above, shall be refunded within fifteen (15) days after receiving written notice from Alltrade that the one-year period has expired.

## 7. SEVERABILITY

If, subsequent to the execution of this Consent Judgment, any provision is held by a court to be unenforceable, the validity of the enforceable provisions remaining shall not be adversely affected.

## 8. GOVERNING LAW

The terms of this Consent Judgment shall be governed by the laws of California and apply within California. In the event that Proposition 65 is repealed or is otherwise rendered inapplicable by reason of law generally, or as to the Products, then Alltrade may provide written notice to Held of any asserted change in the law, and shall have no further obligations pursuant to this Consent Judgment with respect to, and to the extent that, the Products are so affected.

## 9. NOTICES

Unless specified herein, all correspondence and notices required to be provided pursuant to this Consent Judgment shall be sent by: (i) personal delivery; (ii) first-class, registered or certified mail, return receipt requested; or (iii) overnight courier on any Party by the other Party at the following addresses:

To Alltrade:

Andy Livian, CEO
Alltrade Tools LLC 1431 Via Plata Street
Long Beach, CA 90810

To Held:

Proposition 65 Coordinator
The Chanler Group
2560 Ninth Street
Parker Plaza, Suite 214
Berkeley, CA 94710-2565

With a copy to:
David J. Pitman, Esq.
Fulwider Patton LLP
Howard Hughes Center
6060 Center Drive, Tenth Floor
Los Angeles, CA 90045

Any Party may, from time to time, specify in writing to the other Party a change of address to which all notices and other communications shall be sent.

## 10. COUNTERPARTS; FACSIMILE SIGNATURES

This Consent Judgment may be executed in counterparts and by facsimile or portable document format (".pdf") signature, each of which shall be deemed an original, and all of which, when taken together, shall constitute one and the same document. A facsimile or .pdf signature shall be as valid as the original.

## 11. COMPLIANCE WITH HEALTH \& SAFETY CODE § 25249.7(f)

Held and his attorneys agree to comply with the reporting form requirements referenced in California Health \& Safety Code § 25249.7(f).

## 12. ADDITIONAL POST EXECUTION ACTIVITIES

The Parties agree to mutually employ their, and their counsel's, reasonable best efforts to support the entry of this agreement as a Consent Judgment and obtain approval of the Consent Judgment by the Court in a timely manner. The Parties acknowledge that, pursuant to California Health \& Safety Code § 25249.7, a noticed motion is required to obtain judicial approval of this Consent Judgment, which Held shall file, and which Alltrade shall not oppose. If any third party objection to the noticed motion is filed, Held and Alltrade shall work together to file a joint reply and appear at any hearing before the Court. If the Court does not approve the motion to approve this Consent Judgment, and the Parties choose not to pursue a modified Consent Judgment within 30 days of said denial, or in the event that the Court approves this Consent Judgment and any person successfully appeals that approval, all payments made pursuant to this Consent

Judgment will be returned to Alltrade within fifteen (15) days of an order reversing or vacating the approval.

## 13. MODIFICATION

This Consent Judgment may be modified only: (1) by written agreement of the Parties and upon entry of a modified Consent Judgment by the Court thereon; or (2) upon a successful motion of any Party and entry of a modified Consent Judgment by the Court.

## 14. ENTIRE AGREEMENT

This Consent Judgment contains the sole and entire agreement and understanding of the Parties with respect to the entire subject matter hereof, and any and all prior discussions, negotiations, commitments, and understandings related hereto. No representations, oral or otherwise, express or implied, other than those contained herein have been made by any Party hereto. No other agreements not specifically referred to herein, oral or otherwise, shall be deemed to exist or to bind any of the Parties.

## 15. AUTHORIZATION

The undersigned are authorized to execute this Consent Judgment on behalf of their respective parties and have read, understood, and agree to all of the terms and conditions of this Consent Judgment.

## AGREED TO:

## AGREED TO:

Date: December 3, 2014
Date:



Andy Livian, CEO
Alltrade Tools LLC

