1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8	Brian C. Johnson, State Bar No. 23596: Josh Voorhees, State Bar No. 241436 THE CHANLER GROUP 2560 Ninth Street Parker Plaza, Suite 214 Berkeley, CA 94710-2565 Telephone: (510) 848-8880 Facsimile: (510) 848-8118 E-mail: brian@chanler.com E-mail: josh@chanler.com Attorneys for Plaintiff WHITNEY R. LEEMAN, PH.D.	5	
9			
10	SUPERIOR COURT OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA		
11	COUNTY OF ALAMEDA UNLIMITED CIVIL JURISDICTION		
12			
13			
14	WHITNEY R. LEEMAN, PH.D.,	Case No. RG16816698	
1.5	Plaintiff,	[PROPOSED] CONSENT JUDGMENT	
15	,		
16	v.	(Health & Safety Code § 25249.6 et seq. and	
	·		
16	V.	(Health & Safety Code § 25249.6 et seq. and	
16 17	v. DEE ZEE, INC.,	(Health & Safety Code § 25249.6 et seq. and	
16 17 18	v. DEE ZEE, INC.,	(Health & Safety Code § 25249.6 et seq. and	
16 17 18 19	v. DEE ZEE, INC.,	(Health & Safety Code § 25249.6 et seq. and	
16 17 18 19 20	v. DEE ZEE, INC.,	(Health & Safety Code § 25249.6 et seq. and	
16 17 18 19 20 21	v. DEE ZEE, INC.,	(Health & Safety Code § 25249.6 et seq. and	
16 17 18 19 20 21 22	v. DEE ZEE, INC.,	(Health & Safety Code § 25249.6 et seq. and	
16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	v. DEE ZEE, INC.,	(Health & Safety Code § 25249.6 et seq. and	
16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24	v. DEE ZEE, INC.,	(Health & Safety Code § 25249.6 et seq. and	
16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 25	v. DEE ZEE, INC.,	(Health & Safety Code § 25249.6 et seq. and	

1. <u>INTRODUCTION</u>

1.1 Parties

This Consent Judgment is entered into by and between plaintiff Whitney R. Leeman, Ph.D. ("Leeman"), and Dee Zee, Inc. ("Dee Zee"), with Leeman and Dee Zee each individually referred to as a "Party" and collectively as the "Parties."

1.2 Plaintiff

Leeman is an individual residing in California who seeks to promote awareness of exposures to toxic chemicals and to improve human health by reducing or eliminating hazardous substances contained in consumer products.

1.3 Defendant

Dee Zee employs ten or more individuals and is a "person in the course of doing business" for purposes of the Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986, Health and Safety Code section 25249.6 *et seq.* ("Proposition 65").

1.4 General Allegations

Leeman alleges that Dee Zee imports, sells, or distributes for sale in California vinyl/PVC cables that contain di(2-ethylhexyl)phthalate ("DEHP") without first providing the exposure warning required by Proposition 65. DEHP is listed pursuant to Proposition 65 as a chemical known to cause birth defects or other reproductive harm.

1.5 Product Description

The products covered by this Consent Judgment are vinyl/PVC cables containing DEHP that are imported, sold, or distributed for sale in California by Dee Zee ("Products") including, but not limited to, the cable component of the *DeeZee Portable Safe*, *UPC #0 19023 98201 9*.

1.6 Notice of Violation

On August 20, 2015, Leeman served Dee Zee, the California Attorney General, and all other requisite public enforcers with a 60-Day Notice of Violation ("Notice"), alleging that Dee Zee violated Proposition 65 by failing to warn its customers and consumers in California of the health hazards associated with exposures to DEHP from the Products. No public enforcer has commenced and is diligently prosecuting an action to enforce the violations alleged in the Notice.

1.7 Complaint

On May 23, 2016, Leeman filed the instant action ("Complaint"), naming Dee Zee as a defendant for the alleged violations of Proposition 65 that are the subject of the Notice.

1.8 No Admission

Dee Zee denies the material, factual, and legal allegations contained in the Notice and Complaint, and maintains that all of the products it has sold and distributed for sale in California, including the Products, have been, and are, in compliance with all laws. Nothing in this Consent Judgment shall be construed as an admission of any fact, finding, conclusion of law, issue of law, or violation of law, nor shall compliance with this Consent Judgment constitute or be construed as an admission of any fact, finding, conclusion of law, issue of law, or violation of law. This Section shall not, however, diminish or otherwise affect Dee Zee's obligations, responsibilities, and duties under this Consent Judgment.

1.9 Jurisdiction

For purposes of this Consent Judgment only, the Parties stipulate that this Court has jurisdiction over Dee Zee as to the allegations in the Complaint, that venue is proper in Alameda County, and that the Court has jurisdiction to enter and enforce the provisions of this Consent Judgment pursuant to Proposition 65 and Code of Civil Procedure § 664.6.

1.10 Effective Date

For purposes of this Consent Judgment, the term "Effective Date" means the date on which the Motion for Approval of the Consent Judgment is granted by the Court.

2. <u>INJUNCTIVE RELIEF: REFORMULATED PRODUCTS</u>

Commencing on the Effective Date and continuing thereafter, Dee Zee agrees to only manufacture for sale, or purchase for sale in California, "Reformulated Products." For purposes of this Consent Judgment, Reformulated Products are Products containing DEHP in a maximum concentration of 1,000 parts per million (0.1%) when analyzed pursuant to U.S. Environmental Protection Agency testing methodologies 3580A and 8270C or equivalent methodologies utilized by state or federal agencies for the purpose of determining DEHP content in a solid substance.

3. MONETARY SETTLEMENT TERMS

3.1 Civil Penalty Payments

Pursuant to Health and Safety Code § 25249.7(b), and in settlement of all the claims referred to in the Notice, Complaint, and this Consent Judgment, Dee Zee shall pay \$8,000 in civil penalties. Each civil penalty payment shall be allocated according to Health and Safety Code § 25249.12(c)(1) and (d), with seventy-five percent (75%) of the penalty paid to the California Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment ("OEHHA"), and the remaining twenty-five percent (25%) of the penalty retained by Leeman. Leeman's counsel shall be responsible for delivering OEHHA's portion of the penalty payment(s) made under this Consent Judgment.

3.1.1 Initial Civil Penalty Payment

Dee Zee shall make an initial civil penalty payment of \$2,000.

3.1.2 Final Civil Penalty Payment

On October 1, 2016, Dee Zee shall make a final civil penalty payment of \$6,000. Pursuant to title 11 California Code of Regulations, § 3203(c), Leeman agrees that the final civil penalty payment shall be waived in its entirety if, no later than September 15, 2016, an officer of Dee Zee provides Leeman with a signed declaration certifying that all of the Products it is selling, shipping for sale, or distributing for sale in California as of the date of its declaration are Reformulated Products as defined by Section 2, and that Dee Zee will continue to offer only Reformulated Products for sale in California in the future. Alternatively, Dee Zee may certify that it is not currently offering the Products for sale in California but, in the event it decides to recommence sales, it agrees to only offer Reformulated Products. The option to certify product reformulation (or a commitment to reformulate future sales) in lieu of making the final civil penalty payment required by this Section is a material term, and time is of the essence.

3.2 Reimbursement of Attorney's Fees and Costs

The parties acknowledge that Leeman and her counsel offered to resolve this dispute without reaching terms on the amount of fees and costs to be reimbursed to them, thereby leaving the issue to be resolved after the material terms of this Consent Judgment had been settled. Shortly after the other settlement terms had been finalized, the Parties negotiated the compensation due to Leeman and her counsel under general contract principles and the private attorney general doctrine codified at

California Code of Civil Procedure § 1021.5. Accordingly, Dee Zee agrees to pay \$25,000 in the form of a check made payable to "The Chanler Group" for all fees incurred investigating, bringing this matter to Dee Zee's attention, negotiating a settlement in the public interest, and obtaining court approval of the same.

3.3 Payment Timing; Payments Held in Trust

All payments due under this Consent Judgment shall be tendered to Dee Zee's counsel within fifteen (15) days of the date that this agreement is fully executed by the Parties, and held in trust until the Effective Date. Dee Zee's counsel shall provide Leeman's counsel with written confirmation following its receipt of the settlement funds, and within five days of the Court's approval of this Consent Judgment, deliver such funds to Leeman. In the event the final civil penalty payment required by Section 3.1.2 is not waived and becomes due prior to the Effective Date, Dee Zee shall deliver the penalty payment to its counsel to hold in trust until, and disburse within five days after the Effective Date.

3.4 Payment Address

All payments required by this Consent Judgment shall be delivered to:

The Chanler Group Attn: Proposition 65 Controller 2560 Ninth Street Parker Plaza, Suite 214 Berkeley, CA 94710

4. <u>CLAIMS COVERED AND RELEASED</u>

4.1 Leeman's Public Release of Proposition 65 Claims

Leeman, acting on her own behalf and in the public interest, releases Dee Zee and its parents, subsidiaries, affiliated entities under common ownership, directors, officers, employees, and attorneys ("Releasees"), and each entity to whom Dee Zee directly or indirectly distributes or sells the Products including, without limitation, its downstream customers, distributors, wholesalers, retailers and on-line retailers ("Downstream Releasees") for any violation arising under Proposition 65 pertaining to the failure to warn about exposures to DEHP from Products sold or distributed for sale by Dee Zee prior to the Effective Date, as set forth in the Notice. Compliance with the terms of this Consent Judgment constitutes compliance with Proposition 65 with respect to exposures to

DEHP from Products sold or distributed for sale by Dee Zee after the Effective Date.

2

1

3 4

5

6

7 8

9

10 11

12 13

14

15

16 17

18

19

21

20

22

23

24 25

26

27

28

4.2 Leeman's Individual Release of Claims

Leeman, in her individual capacity only and *not* in her representative capacity, also provides a release to Dee Zee, Releasees, and Downstream Releasees which shall be effective as a full and final accord and satisfaction, as a bar to all actions, causes of action, obligations, costs, expenses, attorneys' fees, damages, losses, claims, liabilities and demands of Leeman of any nature, character or kind, whether known or unknown, suspected or unsuspected, arising out of alleged or actual exposures to DEHP in Products manufactured, sold or distributed for sale by Dee Zee prior to the Effective Date.

4.3 Dee Zee's Release of Leeman

Dee Zee, on its own behalf, and on behalf of its past and current agents, representatives, attorneys, successors, and assignees, hereby waives any and all claims against Leeman and her attorneys and other representatives, for any and all actions taken or statements made by Leeman and her attorneys and other representatives, whether in the course of investigating claims, otherwise seeking to enforce Proposition 65 against it in this matter, or with respect to the Products.

5. **COURT APPROVAL**

This Consent Judgment is not effective until it is approved and entered by the Court and shall be null and void if it is not approved and entered by the Court within one year after it has been fully executed by the Parties, or within such additional time as the Parties may agree to in writing.

6. **SEVERABILITY**

If, subsequent to the Court's approval and entry of this Consent Judgment as a judgment, any provision is held by a court to be unenforceable, the validity of the remaining provisions shall not be adversely affected.

7. **GOVERNING LAW**

The terms of this Consent Judgment shall be governed by the laws of the state of California and apply within the state of California. In the event that Proposition 65 is repealed, or is otherwise rendered inapplicable by reason of law generally or as to the Products, then Dee Zee may provide written notice to Leeman of any asserted change in the law, and shall have no further injunctive

1 obligations pursuant to this Consent Judgment with respect to, and to the extent that, the Products are 2 so affected. 3 8. NOTICE 4 Unless specified herein, all correspondence and notice required by this Consent Judgment 5 shall be in writing and sent by: (i) personal delivery; (ii) first-class, registered, or certified mail, 6 return receipt requested; or (iii) a recognized overnight courier to the following addresses: 7 For Dee Zee: 8 Kelli Gallagher, President Dee Zee, Inc. 9 1572 NE 58th Avenue Des Moines, IA 50313 10 with a copy to Dee Zee's counsel: 11 Sandra A. Edwards, Esq. 12 Farella Braun + Martel LLP Russ Building 13 235 Montgomery Street, 17th Floor San Francisco, California 94104 14 For Leeman: 15 Proposition 65 Coordinator 16 The Chanler Group 2560 Ninth Street 17 Parker Plaza. Suite 214 Berkeley, CA 94710-2565 18 19 Any Party may, from time to time, specify in writing to the other, a change of address to which all 20 notices and other communications shall be sent. 21 9. **COUNTERPARTS; FACSIMILE SIGNATURES** 22 This Consent Judgment may be executed in counterparts and by facsimile signature, each of 23 which shall be deemed an original, and all of which, when taken together, shall constitute one and the 24 same document. 25 10. POST EXECUTION ACTIVITIES 26 Leeman agrees to comply with the reporting form requirements referenced in Health and 27 Safety Code § 25249.7(f). The Parties further acknowledge that, pursuant to Health and Safety Code 28 § 25249.7(f), a noticed motion is required to obtain judicial approval of the settlement. In furtherance

		l
1		İ
2		
3		
4	-	
5		
6		-
· 7		
8		
9		
10		
11		
12		
13		
1/1		
1 T		
15		
16		
7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22	-	
23		
24		
	-	
25	-	
26 ⁻	***************************************	
27	-	

of obtaining such approval, the Parties agree to mutually employ their best efforts, and those of their counsel, to support the entry of this agreement as judgment, and to obtain judicial approval of their settlement in a timely manner. For purposes of this Section, "best efforts" shall include, at a minimum, cooperating on the drafting and filing of the necessary moving papers, supporting the motion, and appearing at the hearing before the Court.

11. MODIFICATION

This Consent Judgment may be modified only by: (i) a written agreement of the Parties and entry of a modified consent judgment thereon by the Court; or (ii) a successful motion or application of any Party, and the entry of a modified consent judgment thereon by the Court.

12. <u>AUTHORIZATION</u>

The undersigned are authorized to execute this Consent Judgment and acknowledge that they have read, understand, and agree to all of the terms and conditions contained herein.

AGREED TO:	AGREED TO:
Date: 6/29/16	Date: 4.28.16
Whitney Leeman	Hell Hallagler
By:	By:
WHITNEY R. LEEMAN, PH.D.	Kelli Gallagher, President
	DEE ZEE, INC.